



DignityFIRM Lab 2.1

Intersectionality Guidelines

Applying an intersectional approach to understanding F2F irregular migrant workers

Authors: Hanane Darhour and Siham Marroune Reviewers: Berta Güell and Sterre Naaktgeboren









DignityFIRM WP 2.1: Intersectionality Guidelines

Applying an intersectional approach to understanding F2F irregular migrant workers

Authors: Hanane Darhour and Siham Marroune Reviewers: Berta Güell and Sterre Naaktgeboren

Intersectionality Guidelines- P.1





Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Berta Güell, a researcher at CIDOB and a collaborator of CER-Migrations at the Autonomous University of Barcelona in Spain, and Sterre Naaktgeboren, a PhD candidate in the Sociology of Law and Migration Law at Radboud University in the Netherlands, for their instructive feedback on earlier versions of the guideline.

We would also like to express our gratitude to Tesseltje de Lange, Professor of the Sociology of Law and Migration Law and the principle coordinator of the DignityFIRM project affiliate of Radboud University in the Netherlands, Blanca Garcés-Mascareñas, researcher coordinator at the Barcelona Centre for International Affairs in Spain, Els Rommes, Associate professor of Gender and Diversity and Director of research at Radboud Social Cultural Research, Gottlieb Nora Dalia, a public health scholar at Bielefeld University in Germany, and last but not least Masja van Meeteren, Professor of Criminal Law and Criminology at Radboud University for their valuable feedback and suggestions which helped in the conceptualization and drafting of this guideline.

Further thanks are directed to Irene Palla, a research fellow at the Department of Sociology and Economic Law at the University of Bologna, and to all members of the DignityFIRM consortium for their constructive and insightful contributions, either directly or indirectly, during the monthly DignityFIRM labs.





About the authors

Hanane DARHOUR is professor of English, Gender and Politics at Ibn Zohr University, Faculty of Languages, Arts and Human Sciences in Ait Melloul, Morocco. Her work focuses on public policies addressing women's exclusion/ under-representation in politics and social inequalities, politics of presence, empowerment and social justice with regards to women. Her areas of interest additionally encompass exploring how migrant workers' entitlements and rights are systematically co-created by intersecting *macro-factors*, such as the global/ local politics of production and mobility, as well as *micro-factors* including migrant workers' socio-legal and economic statuses.

Siham MARROUNE is an assistant professor at Ibn Zohr University, Faculty of Languages, Arts and Human Sciences in Ait Melloul, Morocco. Her major areas of interest include Cultural and Gender Studies, Migration, Phenomenology and Memory Studies. She has developed a keen interest in regularisation policies for migrants in Morocco, examining how factors like gender, socio-economic status, and ethnicity shape asylum seekers' and irregular migrants' experiences, exploring the intersectionality of these factors to provide insights into more inclusive and effective migration practices.





Contents

Acknowledgements	2
About the authors	3
About the guideline	5
1. Theoretical framework	8
1.1. Why intersectionality is important to understanding IM labour in the food	
supply chain?	8
1.2. The intersectional nature of global capitalist relations of production	11
1.3. IM Workers' conditions from an intersectional perspective	14
1.4. Research on intersectionality and IM workers in F2F sectors	16
1.5. Intersectionality at the root of the F2F Labour market segmentation	21
1.5.1. Discrimination based on Gender and Race	21
1.5.2. Discrimination based on Nationality and Ethnicity	23
1.5.3. Discrimination based on the Legality of Work	25
1.5.4. Discrimination based on the Legality of Stay	26
1.6. Intersectional analysis of the effects of IM labour on workers	29
1.7. An Intersectional understanding of forms of IM workers' agency	32
2. Methodological considerations	40
2.1. Incorporating intersectionality across the project's WPs	40
2.2. Dimensions, indicators and key questions	42
References	45





About the guideline

The DignityFIRM Intersectionality Guidelines offer a theoretical and methodological guide to carry out research on the intersecting inequalities not only in terms of labour conditions and those inequalities embedded in regulatory infrastructure, but also in terms of access to social and health services among low-waged migrant and non-migrant workers who are involved in the food supply chains in four EU states (Italy, the Netherlands, Poland, Spain) and two associated countries (Morocco and Ukraine). In particular, focus will be directed to four farm to fork¹ (F2F) sectors with different dynamics and traits: agriculture, food processing, hospitality, and food delivery.

The Farm to Fork (F2F) label came from the Farm to Fork Strategy disclosed in May 2020 as Europe's Green Deal Strategy. It is a plan that aims to promote the transition to a fair, healthy and environmentally-friendly and resilient food system by 2030² by relying on an employer-driven approach. The mentioning of the conditions of agro-food workers in the F2F strategy came only once while dealing with the unprecedented health crisis caused by Covid-19 and which led to many disruptions, namely labour shortages. This requires, as it is highlighted in the EU F2F strategy, a specific reduction of the socio-economic implausible outturn that affects the food chain and "ensure that the key principles enacted in the European Pillar of Social Rights are respected, especially when it comes to precarious, seasonal and undeclared workers. The considerations of workers' social protection, working and housing conditions as well as protection of health and safety will play a major role in building fair, strong and sustainable food systems³".

Integral to this F2F plan is that the EU intends to support the global transition to more sustainable food systems through its external policy by ensuring "coherence between the F2F's European and global sustainability ambitions⁴", and by forming

¹ Farm 2 Fork

 ² EU (2020) 'Farm to Fork Strategy for a fair, healthy and environmentally-friendly food system'. https://food.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2020-05/f2f_action-plan_2020_strategy-info_en.pdf.
 ³ Ibid.

⁴ Dekeyser, K. & Woolfrey, S. (2021:5) A Greener Europe at the Expense of Africa: Why the EU Must Address the External Implications of the Farm to Fork Strategy. Briefing note N°137.





"green alliances" with willing partners⁵. What is interesting to DignityFIRM project is the implications of EU's F2F strategy on Morocco and Ukraine's⁶ food supply chain, and by extension on the increasing demand in these countries for cheap and temporary migrant labour.

The main premise of this guide is to explore the multiple grounds upon which irregular workers from migrant backgrounds (their administrative and legal statuses combined with other factors like nationality, gender, race, education, ethnicity, religion, etc.) are recruited for F2F sectors. Their heterogeneity implies that each category benefits, suffers or pursues unique experiences and trajectories that determine their differential access to labour rights and decent work based on the combination of social factors that either empowers or disempowers them. At the core of migrant workers' rights, the concept of human dignity is central. Human dignity which has long been perceived as an eminently moral, philosophical or religious concept, has become a "juridical" binding legal norm, which is "frequently referred to as the cornerstone of the edifice of human rights⁷".

The interconnection between workers' administrative/legal status and their socio-economic status will be studied. A mapping of relevant research dealing with precarious labour and its reliance on migrant labour will be undertaken with the aim to understand how the interconnection between one's work and residence statuses and other socio-economic inequalities shape workers' vulnerability to exploitative work, sexual abuse, racism, human trafficking, crimes, gender-based violence, and Islamophobia, etc. in five EU and two non-EU countries.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Morocco and Ukraine are key countries in the food supply chains of Europe.

⁷ Resta, G. (2020). The Comparative Law of Dignity: An Introduction. MCGILL Law Journal – Revue de Droit de MCGILL. 66:1. https://lawjournal.mcgill.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/04/Article-15-Resta-EMBEDDED.pdf





Drawing on Kimberly Crenshaw's⁸, intersectional analysis of race and sex, these guidelines aim to highlight the irregular administrative and legal status of migrant workers as one of the key axis of intersectional oppression that are relevant to four F2F sectors of interest to DignityFIRM research, namely agriculture, food processing, hospitality and food delivery. Irregular status at work is most often aligned with dirty, heavy and unsafe working conditions, long and uneven working hours and insecure positions with often temporary and seasonal contracts⁹.

The intersectional approach has enormous potential to de-marginalize the intersection of migration and work status with race, gender, nationality, etc. and provide an understanding of the deep structural dynamics shaping the precarious conditions and vulnerabilities of migrants at work in low-waged F2F industries. Previous intersectional studies focused on a single axis of oppression, such as gender or race, with little regard for how, for instance in the context of labour migrant work, the legal or administrative status in addition to other disparities may be more influential on the working conditions of F2F migrant workers. Gender is frequently utilized as a starting point for understanding marginalization and disadvantage, as it remains one of the most ubiquitous forms of inequity and a major source of inequalities, particularly in the food supply chain¹⁰. Within an increasingly exploitative and temporary low-waged F2Flabour market, workers' entitlements alongside their rights are shaped and inflicted by the global/ local politics of production and mobility, as well as other socio-legal and economic relations of domination and subordination.

By undertaking an intersectionality-based analysis, the interconnection between different intersectional identities of workers (such as their administrative/legal status, gender, age and nationality, etc.) in the F2F labour markets, alongside their survival

⁸ Crenshaw, K. (1989). "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics." University of Chicago Legal Forum 1989: 139-167.

⁹ Forde C., MacKenzie R. (2009). Employers'Use of Low-skilled Migrant Workers: Assessing the Implications for Human Resource Management, *International Journal of Manpower* 30(5): 437-452.

 ¹⁰ See Axelsson, M., & Hedberg, L. (2018). Innovations in Environmental Science. Environmental Press; Blair, T. (2022). Modern Challenges in Urban Planning. City Development Publications.





strategies and forms of agency, can be studied. Hence, the major research questions of this guideline is to review the literature with a focus on the following questions: How does the seemingly neutral (EU, national, regional and local) legal infrastructures and practices co-construct discriminations and inequalities on the basis of intersectionality? How does the political economy of labour market segmentation in EU and ACs creates multiple intersectional inequalities among migrant workers within the F2F labour markets? And how do migrant workers' social-economic status intersect with their administrative/legal status to create unique experiences of marginalization and risks for them in the F2F labour markets?

To do so, this guideline is organized into two main parts. The first part is theoretical. It explores the link between the increasingly changing capitalist relations of production and its repercussions on labour standards and workers' conditions. The effects of those repercussions vary depending on the socio-economic vulnerabilities and legal/ administrative statuses of migrant workers. Then, it provides a systematic mapping of the link between migrant work and access to right. It also raises issues on the relevance of intersectionality to IM labour and the contingency of their labour and welfare rights on their legal, and/ or socio-economic status. The guide provides also an understanding of the different survival strategies available for the various categories of irregular migrant workers to forge out forms of resistance and spaces of control over their lives. The second part highlights several indicators and key questions on how to better incorporate and be sensitive to complex issues that carry underneath intersectional motives, realities or outcomes.

1. Theoretical framework

1.1. Why intersectionality is important to understanding IM labour in the food supply chain?

The different variables and categories that shape human migration necessitate the use of intersectionality to come to grips with the multiple complexities of migration alongside its constitutive processes. The implementation of intersectionality in





migration studies unpacks and enriches our understanding of how migrants experience multiple challenges such as social inequities, injustice and oppression. It helps visualize the interdependency between the characteristic forms of oppression in migration processes revealing how identities intersect to grant advantages for some while preventing others. This is quite obvious when applying intersectionality to understand F2F migrant/mobile labour.

Intersectionality is an epistemology of situated and partial knowledge that keeps up a transversal openness and dialogical approach to all academic disciplines. It provides an analytical tool that looks into the intersections between agri-food workers' administrative and legal status and other power differentials based on gender, race, class, ethnicity, geopolitical positioning, age, disability, etc. Intersectionality is the best fit to address and leaf through the various systems at play because of its ability to understand "social locations on the margins, borders, and boundaries of identity categories¹¹".

Bastia¹² outlines that migrants in particular are able to disrupt borders and transcend boundaries in various ways, which make them ideal subjects for intersectional analysis. Yet, the concept of intersectionality is multifaceted, with at least three distinct applications. First, intersectionality serves to delineate the extent to which various categories have the capacity to effect gender relations admitting the latter as being always classed and racialized. Second, it is used to discern a conceivable interaction of any social category without necessarily involving gender or race as the only potential aspects. The third use requires the explicit contribution to social justice through the investigation of the intersection of dissimilar categories of disadvantage¹³ in direct relation with the praxis world.

¹¹ Hill Collins, P., & Bilge, B. (2016: 224).

¹² Bastia, T. (2014). "Intersectionality, Migration and Development." Progress in Development Studies 14 (3): 237-248. doi:10.1177/1464993414521330.

¹³ Bastia, T. (2019). Gender, Migration and Social Transformation: Intersectionality in Bolivian Itinerant Migrations. London: Routledge.





Current intersectional studies on work and organizations¹⁴ analyse intersectionality as embedded in structures of oppression and contribute to enhance knowledge on the experiences of low skilled and precarious work. We build on this literature to explore how administrative/ legal status of F2F migrant workers along with other socio-economic inequalities intersect in a way that affects their access to labour and welfare rights.

The concern with the interconnections between different kinds of identities and hierarchies is not new, and there has long been a theoretical and political interest in studying the connections in social interactions between different types of subordination and exploitation, among of which race theorists exploring the connections between race and class¹⁵. Instead of conflating different experiences of irregular migrant workers under a homogenizing category¹⁶, this DignityFIRM guide tries to look at the intersection between the various layers of irregularity in stay and informality at work and how each pattern of irregularity and informality co-create along with other identity markers unique experiences of discrimination against IM workers.

An intersectional frame examines the disadvantageous processes that result from the confluence of two or more separate categories or identities, such as those that combine a person's legal and administrative status with their gender, ethnicity, nationality, race, or class. The development of new categories of disadvantage is linked to the socio-legal framework in which Crenshaw's¹⁷ significant contribution is anchored. According to this viewpoint, the union of two minority features generates a distinct single-minority entity, giving rise to specific forms of disadvantage that cannot be

¹⁴ See Holvino, E. (2010). Intersections: The simultaneity of race, gender and class in organization studies. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 17(3), 248-277; and Rodriguez, J. K., Holvino, E., Fletcher, J. K., & Nkomo, S. M. (2016). The theory and praxis of intersectionality in work and organizations: Where do we go from here? *Gender, Work and Organization*.

¹⁵ See Myrdal (1962); Miles (1989).

¹⁶ Tapia, M., and Alberti, G., (2019). Unpacking the Category of Migrant Workers in Trade Union Research: A Multi-Level Approach to Migrant Intersectionalities. Work Employment and Society 33 (2), pp.314-325

¹⁷ Crenshaw, K. (1991). "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color." *Stanford Law Review* 43 (6): 1241-1299. doi:10.2307/1229039.





explained by race or gender alone, or by adding the one to the other. Significantly, the core dispute regarding the use or abuse, or what is known as epistemic violence,¹⁸ of conceptualising the intersectional lens in migration studies centres on its potential projection onto other fields without acknowledging its origins in the inherent politics and thoughts of Black feminism¹⁹.

Intersectionality focuses on the mechanisms that rise to the experience of diverse types of inequalities²⁰. This has been more important in recent years, given the increased focus in European equality policies to address many strands of inequality²¹. The status of entry impacts residency and work privileges and determines eligibility for social assistance programs. Because residency, employment, and associated privileges generally differ by gender and other socio-economic inequalities, female migrants are more likely to be disadvantaged than male migrants. Racial, nationality, and gender hierarchies in destination countries are also significant and influence migrant women and men's social and labour market inclusion.

1.2. The intersectional nature of global capitalist relations of production

Approaching labour as a regime or mediating category²² that associates politicaleconomic scales with the socio-cultural relations' scales²³ offers insights into how labour control and mobility management within global food chains interact with more local labour directives to ultimately structure diverse exploitative and precarious forms of

¹⁸ Mollett, S., & Faria, C. (2018). The spatialities of The spatialities of intersectional thinking: fashioning feminist geographic futures. Gender, Place & Culture.

¹⁹ Bastia, T. (2019). Gender, Migration and Social Transformation: Intersectionality in Bolivian Itinerant Migrations. London: Routledge

²⁰ Darhour, H. (2020). "Whose empowerment? Gender Quota Reform Mechanisms and De-democratization in Morocco". In Darhour, H. & Dahlerup, D. (Eds). Double-Edged politics on women's rights in the MENA region. Gender and Politics Series: Palgrave Macmillan. ISBN 978-3-030-27734-5.

²¹ Verloo, M. (2006). Multiple Inequalities, Intersectionality and the European Union. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 211-228.

²² Pattenden, J. (2016). "Working at the margins of global production networks: local labour control regimes and rural-based labourers in south India". *Third World Quarterly* 37 (10): 1809-33.

²³ Taylor, M. & Rioux, S. (2018). *Global Labour Studies*. Cambridge: Polity.





labour conditions and rights²⁴. According to Baglioni²⁵, the notion of labour regime can be used to "capture the varied experiences of labouring in the global economy" or to refer to "national-level systems of industrial relations and employment regulation²⁶". Blair²⁷ defines it as the systematic way in which labour is recruited, compensated, and disciplined, while Li^{28} describes that the term refers to the arrangement and regulations that set the "conditions under which people work".

In the same vein, Burawoy²⁹ used the term "factory regimes" to expand the scope of the "politics of production" and the way in which labour control is thought about beyond the workplace. In particular, it is also shaped by the state's national labour market interventions and regulations that aim to defend workers' employment laws, collective bargaining rights, and basic social safety nets. On the contrary to the interests of capital accumulation in a process of competitive undermining of labour standards and compensation, labour becomes subservient to the objectives of expanded capital accumulation.

Within feminist political economy, a hierarchical colonial and postcolonial view of global agrarian capitalism is used to capture the gendered and intersectional nature of labour regimes sustaining global agrarian production³⁰. This scholarship included all the necessary components for a labour regime analysis even if it did not use the concept of labour regime explicitly. It focused on various intersectional forms of exploitation and subordination dynamics; made use of territorial and institutional and temporal

²⁴ Locke, R. (2013). The Promise and Limits of Private Power: Promoting Labor Standards in a Global Economy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

²⁵ Baglioni, E., et al. (2018) 'Exploitation and Labour Regimes: A Research 16 Agenda', paper presented at the Global Conference on Economic Geography, Cologne, July.

²⁶ Baglioni, E., et al. (2022). Introduction: Labour Regimes and Global Production. Baglioni, Elena, L. Campling, N. M. Coe and A. Smith (Eds.) Labour Regimes and Global Production. UK: Agenda Publishing.

²⁷ Blair, J. (2022). Gendered labour regimes in global production. In Baglioni, E., et al. (Eds.) Labour Regimes and Global Production. UK: Agenda Publishing, 29-44.

²⁸ Li, T. (2017). "The price of un/freedom: Indonesia's colonial and contemporary plantation labor regimes". Comparative Studies in Society and History 59 (2): 245-76.

²⁹ Burawoy, M. (1985). The Politics of Production: Factory Regimes under Capitalism and Socialism. London: Verso.

³⁰ Fernández-Kelly, P. (1983). For We Are Sold, I and My People: Women and Industry in Mexico's Frontier. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.





contexts of production and reproduction relations, be them precolonial, colonial or postcolonial. This literature is, in turn, associated with the feminist approaches to the world-ecology theory which underlay the nexus between productive and reproductive work within centre-periphery relations. The centre countries of advanced capitalism mobilise the disadvantaged labour force from the periphery for work purposes³¹.

The creation of difference across the intersections of status, gender, race, and ethnicity, etc. lay at the core of labour regimes in food supply chain economies³². Afonja³³ and Mackintosh³⁴ observed that agribusiness firms depended on armies of female workers created by the various ways capitalism had changed gender roles from housewives to farm workers³⁵. As a result, this work was critical in that it began to expose some of the hidden relationships between the material components of women's exploitation and the gendered stereotypes about them as docile, submissive, available and cheap workers. Central to Bair's³⁶ argument is the understanding of the role that gender plays in the establishment and operation of value relations in global production systems. According to Bair global value chains shows how capital uses social difference³⁷.

We also know from previous research³⁸ that an altered geography of employment has direct implications on labour conditions. The case of Sweden's wild berry industry demonstrates how employment has been reconfigured by engaging transnational subcontractors that posted workers from Thailand. Not only do they play a mediation role between the workers and their employers in Sweden, but they also placed them

³¹ Hellio, E., & Moreno, J. (2021). "La ecología-mundo bajo plástico: un análisis de la articulación entre la explotación de la naturaleza, el racismo y el sexismo en la producción de frutos rojos de Huelva". *Relaciones Internacionales*, (47), 125-142.

³² Young, K., et al. (eds) 1981. Of Marriage and the Market. London: CSE Books.

 ³³ Afonja, S. (1981). "Changing modes of production and the sexual division of labor among the Yoruba". Signs 7 (2): 299-313.

³⁴ Mackintosh, M. (1981). "Gender and economics". In *Of Marriage and the Market*, K. Young, C. Wolkowitz & R. McCullagh (eds), 1-15. London: CSE Books.

³⁵ Mies, M. (2014). Patriarchy and Accumulation on a World Scale. London: Zed Books.

 ³⁶ Blair, J. (2022). Gendered labour regimes in global production. Baglioni, Elena, L. Campling, N. M. Coe and A. Smith (Eds.) Labour Regimes and Global Production. UK: Agenda Publishing, 29-44.
 ³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Axelsson, L and Hedberg, C. (2018). Emerging topologies of transnational employment: 'Posting'Thai workers in Sweden's wild berry industry beyond regulatory reach. Geoforum 89, pp.1-10





beyond the regulatory frame of the host country, and thereby enables wild berry actors to circumvent regulations that hold them directly accountable to the posted Thai workers. This echoes the notion of "geographies of intersectionality"³⁹ developed by Rodó-Zárate as a concept to confirm that intersecting inequalities are geographically positioned in a particular temporal and spatial background which structurally becomes part of the power relationship apparatus⁴⁰.

Moroccan women temporary workers, for instance, are vulnerable as a result of their social positioning within "the power and labour structure of GECCO⁴¹. Such positioning is marked by the mutual constitution of different axes of inequality that lay across women's identities and experiences within systemic centre-periphery relationships⁴². The intersectional institutional discrimination embedded in the GECCO programme bears appalling effects on these women starting from the phase of recruitment to the working and living conditions⁴³. This structural form of discriminative selection based on distinct elements like gender, motherhood, age, cultural ethnic and rural belonging reinforces different forms of neoliberal economic policy based on exploitation, serving the system of production together with employers' benefits⁴⁴.

1.3. IM Workers' conditions from an intersectional perspective

IM labour in the F2F sectors is a highly debated topic because it is at the core of the EU foundations of freedom of movement and labour rights for a decent work.

³⁹Rodó-Zárate, M. (2021).

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹see Jeroen Doomernik, Blanca, Garcés-Mascareñas & Berta Güell 's Seasonal Workers in Agriculture: The Cases of Spain and The Netherlands in Times of Covid-19 is part of the IMISCOE Research Series book series (IMIS). This programme (called *Gestión Colectiva de Contrataciones en Origen*, GECCO) functioned thus as a way to guarantee the availability of workers from a particular origin and in a particular moment in time. In the case of Lleida, the whole system was led by the *Fundación Pagesos Solidaris*, which centralised the recruitment process and even reception and training at destination. In the campaign of 2007-2008, which is when the highest number of workers came through GECCO, employers in Huelva recruited about 40,000 workers and in Lleida about 7000 (Díaz et al., 2014) Taken from https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-031-26002-5_11

⁴² Güell, Berta (2022). Intersectionality meets seasonal agricultural work: the case of Huelva in times of COVID-19, Estudios Geográficos, 83 (293), e113. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022119.119

⁴³ Ibid.

⁴⁴ Ibid.





However, labour mobility across the borders is a challenge especially if labour standards can be undermined and workers can be exploited. Of particular interest, this guideline covers labour mobility regimes by looking namely into how laws and policies regulate temporary low-waged or flexible forms of migrant labour in the EU and AC. It also explores how both systems protect workers both as migrants and workers.

In Europe, labour market segmentation and demographic shortfall drive an increasing demand for irregular migrant labour in the Food chain market, which is characterized by a significant structural reliance on mobile EU citizens and non-EU citizens' nationalities, particularly irregular migrants. Rye, et al.⁴⁵ highlighted, for instance, how the development of Norway's horticulture industry between 1999 and 2010 resulted in a systematic replacement of family and domestic labour with low-wage migrant labour. The implications of this change suggest that the strategic and intentional move towards the proletarization of Norwegian horticulture relies on the availability of low-wage and flexible global labour workforce from the Global South. This demand for low-waged mobile and temporary migrant workers raise the challenge of setting a flexible and proactive sectoral regulatory framework that allows balancing flexibility and proactivity with worker protection from exploitation, as well as establishing a clear and realistic set of rights and duties for both employees.

For instance, due to the distinct seasonal nature of agricultural employment as well as the nature of this mostly undesirable job, agriculture has often relied on state immigration policy to guarantee that firms have access to a proper quantity and quality of low-wage labour. For instance, since the 1940s, there have been international migration programs running in German agriculture⁴⁶, French agriculture⁴⁷, and British

⁴⁵ Rye, J.F. et al. (2018). From Family to Domestic and Global Labour? A Decade of Proletarisation of Labour in the Norwegian Horticulture Industry. European Countryside 10 (4), pp.528-542

⁴⁶ Fialkowska, K. & M. Piechowska (2016) New way, old pattern. Seasonal migration from Poland to Germany. Arbor 192(777).

⁴⁷ Crenn, C. (2017) Wine heritage and ethnicization of labour: Arab workers in the bordeaux vineyards. in A. Corrado, C. De Castro and D. Perrotta eds., *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the mediterranean area. Routledge*, Abingdon: Routledge; Decósse, F. (2017) Persistent unfree





agriculture⁴⁸. Labour mobility regimes and the means for adapting them play a critical role in the restructuring and strengthening of capitalist relations of production at a global scale. Particularly, agri-business regulations together with labour migration systems have conditioned F2F labour markets to ensure a low-waged temporary migrant labour productivity⁴⁹. Despite technological advances, the demand for low-waged temporary labour force in agriculture has largely persisted in Europe. The mobilization of temporary labour mobility programs has raised human rights issues that protect mobile migrant workers, both as migrants and as workers, from problems of (severe) exploitation in F2F sectors where production is the most intensive and labour is not suited to everybody as it is tough, repetitive and exhaustive and the products are small in size and delicate (e.g. strawberry, tomato, mushroom, and other small fruit cultivations and greenhouses).

1.4. Research on intersectionality and IM workers in F2F sectors

Our theoretical framework draws on different bodies of literature and conceptualisations of migrant labour, often characterized by precarious legal and administrative status and limited access labour and welfare rights in EU and non-EU societies. This mapping of the literature focuses on the migrant labour by reviewing four F2Fsectors, where work is generally low-waged, precarious and inclusive of irregular patterns of work. Various studies⁵⁰ have explored the low-skilled and precarious work⁵¹ documenting the experience of individuals whose status as migrants contribute to the 'precariousness' of their situation⁵². The geography of the supply side of farm

⁴⁹ Mackintosh (1981); Axelsson and Hedberg (2018) ; Blair (2022).

labour in French intensive agriculture: An historical overview of the 'ofii' temporary farmworkers programme. Pp. 183- 197. in A. Corrado, et al. (eds) *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area*. Abingdon: Routledge.

⁴⁸ Scott, S. (2015) Making the case for temporary migrant worker programmes: evidence from the UK's rural guest worker ('SAWS') scheme. *Journal of Rural Studies* 40 pp. 1-11

⁵⁰ Barthold, C. et al. (2022). Intersectionality on screen. A coloniality perspective to understand popular culture representations of intersecting oppressions at work. Gender Work and Organization 29 (6), pp.1890-1909.

⁵¹ Acker, J. (2006). "Inequality Regimes: Gender, Class, and Race in Organizations." Gender & Society 20: 441-464. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243206289499.

⁵² See Ressia, S., et al. 2017. "Operationalizing Intersectionality: An Approach to Uncovering the Complexity of the Migrant Job Search in Australia." Gender, Work and Organization, 24(4): 376-397.





labour especially in Mediterranean countries has lately transformed into an international demand for migrant workers. An estimate of 90% of Greece's and 34% of Italy's farm workers are international migrants⁵³. While France and Spain's horticulture have long been reliant on migrants, Northern European horticulture industries have more recently become dependent on inexpensive and available foreign farm workers. It is argued that one "cannot speak of a Spanish agriculture, but rather of the global enclaves of agricultural production of Huelva, Lleida, Murcia, Almeria, and others"⁵⁴. A more recent trend is the turning of Eastern Europe and other associated countries, such as Morocco, into host countries of third country nationals and sub-Saharan migrants. Both testify to the rising demand for a foreign workforce in the horticulture industries of these countries⁵⁵.

The multifaceted and fluid nature of the concept of irregularity becomes complex and difficult to grasp across jurisdictions which looks into how irregular migrant labour is connected to migration dynamics in Europe and ACs. Workers in low-wage food-related labour contexts commonly perform physically tough and precarious work⁵⁶; they are considered substitutable; mostly employed on seasonal contract⁵⁷s; and, finally, are hired because they are associated with historically disadvantaged or minority groups, who work in these kind of jobs for survival. Precarious work has become the new standard in labour markets⁵⁸ over the previous decade as a result of globalization, new

⁵³ See Gertel, J. & Sippel, S. R. (2014). Seasonal Workers in Mediterranean Agriculture. Abingdon: Routledge; Corrado, A., de Castro, C. & Perrotta, D. (2017). Migration and Agriculture Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. Routledge: London.

⁵⁴ Avallone, G. (2017). The land of informal intermediation: The social regulation of migrant agricultural labour in the Piana del Sele, Italy. In A. Corrado, C. De Castro and D. Perrotta eds., Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. Abingdon: Routledge.pp.138.

⁵⁵ Gorny, A. & Kaczmarczyk, P. (2018). A known but uncertain path: The role of foreign labour in Polish agriculture. *Journal of Rural Studies* 64, 177-188. DOI: 10.1016/j.jrurstud.2017.12.015.

⁵⁶ Van Den Borre L., Deboosere P. (2018) 'Health Risks in the Cleaning Industry: A Belgian Census-linked Mortality Study (1991-2011)', International Archives of Occupational and Environmental Health 91: 13-21.

⁵⁷ Forde C., MacKenzie R. (2009). Employers'Use of Low-skilled Migrant Workers: Assessing the Implications for Human Resource Management, *International Journal of Manpower* 30(5): 437-452.

⁵⁸ Alberti G., Hardy K., Trappmann V., et al. (2018). 'In, Against and Beyond Precarity: Work in Insecure Times', Work, Employment and Society 32(3): 447-57.





technology, employer risk shifting, and workforce heterogeneity⁵⁹. This implies an increase in contractual types of zero-hour contracts, and subcontracting in multi-employer contexts, temporary agency labour, and brokerage which are prominent in low-waged F2F work.

Fernandez and Valencia⁶⁰ explore the negative effects of one of the characterizing features of the global capitalist economy, which is outsourcing in Latin America. Outsourcing or the delegation of productive activities to other companies, regions and countries is beneficial for corporations since it aims to reduce the production costs by exempting companies from their social responsibilities with workers, but it is detrimental to workers since it increases informal and precarious forms of labour. In Southern Europe, the majority of migrants working in agriculture are from the Balkans, Eastern Europe and Africa, and they are frequently employed in seasonal jobs. Seasonal work require intricate bureaucratic processes, and both the business and the potential immigrant misuse their terms⁶¹. The legal admission quotas in Italy, Spain and Greece are never enough to meet the actual needs in cultivations; needs which are almost always seasonal and unpredictable. A large and adaptable migrant labour force with irregular or precarious immigration status is also present. Young males from sub-Saharan Africa, North Africa, or South-east Asia who were refused refuge, had their claims for asylum pending, or had overstayed seasonal (or other) permits make up this labour population⁶².

Studies report that European Union citizens (namely young women from the UK, Italy and Spain ⁶³) are also involved in irregular work in agriculture and subject to both

⁵⁹ Rubery J., Grimshaw D., Johnson M. (2018) 'Challenges and Contradictions in the "Normalising" of Precarious Work', Work, Employment and Society 32(3): 509-27.

⁶⁰ Fernandez, DC and Valencia, AS. (2013). Outsourcing and the New Labor Precariousness in Latin America. Latin American Perspectives 40 (5), pp.14-26

⁶¹ Amnesty International. (2012). Exploited Labour. Migrant Workers in Italy's Agricultural Sector. Amnesty International, London, available from www.amnesty.org/en/documents/EUR30/020/2012/en/.

⁶² Triandafyllidou, A. (2016). Irregular migrant domestic workers in Europe : Who cares. Routledge.

⁶³ Cillo, R. and T. Toffanin. (2014). Corporate Social Responsibility to Prevent Human Trafficking. Immigrant Workers in Italian Agriculture. A Mapping. University of Venice.





exploitation and sexual abuse⁶⁴. Another sector that attracts intra-European mobility with high levels of labour exploitation is the logistics in Northern European countries like the Netherlands, which employs a labour force from Spain under very poor working and living conditions⁶⁵.

In the same vein, Dyer⁶⁶ et al. concluded in his qualitative study of foreign-born workers in a west London hotel that migratory status, in post-industrial economies, should be seen as intersecting with gender in the formation of a gendered performance at work. Cheap and low-skilled labour in industrialized countries as well as a considerable number of developing nations in North Africa remains evident in agriculture, food processing and distribution.

Informalization of low skilled and poorly paid jobs via deregulation, downgrading of manufacturing processes, and flexibilization of employment with increased focus on cost-cutting measures and subcontracting are the main features of this labour market⁶⁷. In the employment relationships that are neither declared nor registered with the relevant authorities, workers carrying out this type of hidden work generally lack a contract of employment, resulting in their payments being undeclared. EU nationals are susceptible to comparable circumstances and risks as non-EU nationals in F2F sectors which is characterized with high seasonal fluctuations of demand.

There are multiple models of migrant labour in Europe, each with unique historical roots and contemporary characteristics. The unpredictable character of the domestic and global food markets discourages long-term investments in mechanized production when a cheap and abundant migrant labour force may be attracted from the most vulnerable segments of the migratory population. Migration policy does, in fact,

⁶⁴ Palumbo, L. (2015). Protection of Trafficked People in Italy: Policies, Limits and Challenges. Journal of Money Laundering Control 18(1):52-65. doi:10.1108/JMLC-01-2014-0001.

⁶⁵ Colectivo de Investigación Arosa Sun. (2020). "Explotación de la nueva emigración española en el corazón logístico de Europa". Available at: https://digitum.um.es/digitum/bitstream/10201/110735/1/InformeHol..0.pdf

 ⁶⁶ Dyer, S; McDowell, L and Batnitzky, A. (2010). The Impact of Migration on the Gendering of Service Work: The Case of a West London Hotel. GENDER WORK AND ORGANIZATION 17 (6), pp.635-657

⁶⁷ Ibid, P5.





play a significant part in this situation by restricting avenues for secure legal labour migration, which results in a large, young male labour force with an irregular or insecure legal status that is open to law-waged and exploitative employment⁶⁸. National or local workers refuse these employments, referred to as the 3D's jobs (dirty, degrading, dangerous) because of its inferior salaries, its seasonality which mean they work only in production peaks and its physically demanding and degrading jobs.

The hospitality and tourist sectors depend on migrant workers for labour. Research⁶⁹ indicates that workplace inclusion in these sectors is significantly influenced by formal migrant workers educational attainment, length of stay or status, time spent working for a tourism organization, participation in innovative problem-solving at work, and assistance to co-workers; and that two inclusion dimensions have a significant impact on the psychological health of migrant workers: belongingness and distinctiveness. In his qualitative study of migrant labour in the UK food industry, Davies⁷⁰ argues that full 'labour justice' requires close attention to routine labour exploitation practices which are less brutal, but still exploitative and harmful. Most research and policy tend to overlook routine labour exploitations when compared with severe exploitation that require 'criminal justice' interventions. This leads to other examples of female labour exploitation, like the housekeepers and cleaners in hotels of touristic coastal areas in Spain, who suffer from high levels of precarity with seasonal job contracts and low salaries. In turn, there are studies which report the health effects of the labour conditions in this type of job, including body pains (specifically in the back and neck), musculoskeletal disorders, dermatological and respiratory diseases and allergies, sleep disorders, eating disorders, hypertension, stress, and depression⁷¹.

⁶⁸ Potter, M. and J. Hamilton. (2014). Picking on Vulnerable Migrants: Precarity and the Mushroom Industry in Northern Ireland. Work, Employment & Society, April. doi:10.1177/0950017013510760.

⁶⁹ Adam, I., et al. (2023). Migrant worker inclusion and psychological well-being: Insights from the hospitality and tourism workplace. Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management 55, pp.448-459
⁷⁰ Davies L (2020). For any construction because of migrant workplace in the LWC for any construction.

⁷⁰ Davies, J. (2019). From severe to routine labour exploitation: The case of migrant workers in the UK food industry. Criminology & Criminal Justice 19 (3), pp.294-310.

 ⁷¹ Cañada, E. (2019). "El trabajo de las camareras de piso: un estado de la cuestión". Papers de Turisme, 62: 67-84.





1.5. Intersectionality at the root of the F2F Labour market segmentation

The dual or segmented labour market theory⁷² has been frequently used in the literature on migrant labour⁷³ to explain how migrant workers occupy subordinate positions relative to more advantageous primary segments of the labour market with low wages and poor working conditions below the labour standards. The axis of stratification is by their identity markers and fissures, such as migration and work status, age, gender, ethnicity, race, and intersections of these factors. The European Observatory of Working Life (2019) defines labour market segmentation as the persistent inequalities in the working conditions of workers in the labour market, where "some workers enjoy stable and secure careers with good development prospects, others face instability in employment, income uncertainty and poor career prospects⁷⁴".

1.5.1. Discrimination based on Gender and Race

Certain labour markets are *masculinized* and others are *feminized*⁷⁵. Others are *racialized showing a preference for a specific race*, and others have preferences on the basis of *nationality* either because of geographical proximity, historical relations, or bureaucratic convenience. Certain employers prefer to employ workers from TCN whose countries have bilateral agreements with the EU. A closer attention to the literature (based on ILO Data) of labour market access in EU countries shows that migrant women have been more affected than men especially during the pandemic period. Within the apparatus of the segmented labour market, substantial

⁷² See Doeringer, P.B. and M. Piore (1971) Internal labor markets and manpower analysis. Lexington, MA: DC Heath; and Piore, M. (1979) Birds of passage: Migrant labour in industrialised societies. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

 ⁷³ Hoggart, K. and C. Mendoza (1999) African immigrant workers in Spanish agriculture. Sociologia Ruralis 39 (4) pp. 538-562.

⁷⁴ Eurofound (2019) Labour Market Segmentation : https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/en/europeanindustrial-relations-dictionary/labour-market-segmentation

⁷⁵ Palumbo, L and Sciurba, A. (2018). The vulnerability to exploitation of women migrant workers in agriculture in the EU: the need for a Human Rights and Gender based approach. European Union.





discrimination based on gender, race, ethnicity, age, origin, and legal status, inequality and economic hardship are among the most glaring aspects of capitalism⁷⁶.

The intersection between gender and race is what identifies the system of employment that constitutes the existing social policies in European countries: "migrant women are pushed either into the private sector or into precarious employment amid the COVID pandemic"⁷⁷. Another aspect of market segmentation is spatial segregation⁷⁸ which takes the form of harassment and exploitation at the workplace against migrant women with apparent impunity allowed by gendered and racist norms⁷⁹ and anchored in labour market policies.

Gender divisions exist in the low-waged F2F labour markets. Spanish farmers in the red berries sector of Huelva, for example, have developed a preference for Moroccan women because they are supposed to be more delicate and docile. Men and their masculinity are preferable in other crops. For instance, in Greece, employers might take advantage of the gender norms and ideologies that circulate among Pakistani agricultural workers who compete to collect more fruit and be productive as a symbol of masculinity⁸⁰. Yet, women bear the largest burden of racial discrimination initially produced by business and private employers across all occupations within a capitalist economic society⁸¹.

As women's domestic work is basically undermined by formal economy⁸², low wages are racialized and this racialization of low wages is particularly connected to

⁷⁶ Hamedanian, F. (2022). "Access to the European Labor Market for Immigrant Women in the Wake of the COVID Pandemic" World 3, no. 4: 957-978. https://doi.org/10.3390/world3040054

⁷⁷ Ibid

⁷⁸ Gilbert, M.R. (1998). "Race", Space, and Power: The Survival Strategies of Working Poor Women. Ann. Assoc. Am. Geogr., 88, 595-621. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2564094.

⁷⁹ kabeer, N, et al. (2021). Feminist economic perspectives on the COVID-19 pandemic. Fem. Econ, 27, 1-29.

⁸⁰ Kukreja, R. (2021). Recouping masculinity: Understanding the links between macho masculinity and selfexploitation among undocumented South Asian male migrants in Greece. *Geoforum*, 122, 164-173.

⁸¹ Hartmann, H. (1976). Capitalism, Patriarchy, and Job Segregation by Sex. Signs, 1, 137-169. http://www.jstor.org/ stable/3173001.

⁸² Grimshaw, D., & Rubery, J. (2015). The motherhood pay gap: A review of the issues, theory and international evidence. ILO. https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/workingpapers/WCMS_348041/lang--en/index.htm





women⁸³. Indeed, Gender preferences can sometimes interact with ethnicity and legal status, resulting in the segmentation and disintegration of the workforce into different groups of workers which gives rise to rivalry between the different groups of workers and among workers within the same group⁸⁴. For example, Boeckler and Berndt⁸⁵ describe how, in Almeria, Spain "illegal" Moroccan males were first favoured, but were later replaced by "legal" Romanians of both sexes, with employers thereafter explicitly recruiting Moroccan females on seasonal work permits.

1.5.2. Discrimination based on Nationality and Ethnicity

The country's demand for labour is related to the demographic characteristics and geopolitical origin of the available workforce. Differences in the working conditions between groups that share similar characteristics in terms of their skills, occupation and experience indicate that other factors determine labour market segmentation, based on demand and preferences. These factors could include institutional settings (state economy relations that react to the detriment of employees), the economic cycle in a country (seasonality), or employer strategies that create more or less favourable conditions for specific worker groups. A contradictory location may result from one of the many varied and unequal social patterns of dominance and subordination⁸⁶. For example, migrants returning to their home countries may profit from class privileges when they demonstrate relative richness to less affluent communities. Despite being inferior in the country of migration, a migrant woman may gain better social standing when she returns to her place of origin due to

⁸³ Solati, F. (2018). Women, Work, and Patriarchy in the Middle East and North Africa; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany.

⁸⁴ Hellio, E., & Moreno, J. (2021). "La ecología-mundo bajo plástico: un análisis de la articulación entre la explotación de la naturaleza, el racismo y el sexismo en la producción de frutos rojos de Huelva". *Relaciones Internacionales*, (47), 125-142.

⁸⁵Boeckler, M. & Berndt, C. (2014). B/Ordering Mediterranean: Free Trade, Fresh Fruits and Fluid Fixity. In J. Gertel y S. Ruth Sippel(eds), Seasonal Workers in Mediteranean Agriculture: The Scoial Costs of eating Fresh, Routledge. pp. 23-34.

⁸⁶ Wright, J.B. (1985). The Geological Setting in Geology and Mineral Resources of West Africa. Springer. ISBN : 978-94-015-3934-0. Anthias, F. (2013). Hierarchies of social location, class and intersectionality : Towards a translocational frame. *International Sociology*, 28(1), 121-138. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580912463155</u>





her relative economic success⁸⁷, giving her a contradictory social location internationally.

The low-waged labour markets are therefore not uniform. To comprehend this type of employer-driven segmentation⁸⁸, Waldinger and Lichter⁸⁹'s used the concept of "hiring queue", to describe the ways in which employers rank various but competing groups of prospective employees according to their perceived employability. Employers prejudice and perceptions systematically differ across time and place to yield to different practices of recruitment. First, hiring queues with businesses across Europe and ACs use ethnic, national, religious, and racial indicators to locate better labourers. Moroccans and Pole fruit pickers dominate the South of France⁹⁰; Thai labourers are regarded as better wild berry pickers in Sweden⁹¹and Finland⁹²; sub-Saharan workers constitute an important labour force in the Moroccan farm enclaves of Sous Mass⁹³. Accordingly, they take advantage of the entry of Romania and Bulgaria in the EU, and the associated facilities to recruit employees from these countries.

Azzeruoli⁹⁴ offers an example which shows the way prejudices are arbitrary with regard to farmers. Italian farmers defend their preference for hiring Indian milk workers

⁸⁷ See Bandana, P. (2010). Interrogating Intersectionality: Contemporary Globalisation and Racialised Gendering in the Lives of Highly Educated South Asian Americans and their Children, Journal of Intercultural Studies, 31:1, 29-47, DOI: 10.1080/07256860903477696

⁸⁸ Waldinger, R. and M.I. Lichter. (2003). *How the other half work: Immigration and the social organisation of labour*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

 ⁹⁰ Sippel, S.R. and J. Gertel (2014) Shared insecurities. Farmers and workers in Bouches-du-Rhône. Pp. 37-48 in, Seasonal workers in mediterranen agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh. London: Abingdon.

⁹¹ Eriksson, M., Tollefsen, A. (2013). Of Berries and Seasonal Work. In: Geiger, M., Pécoud, A. (eds) Disciplining the Transnational Mobility of People. International Political Economy Series. Palgrave Macmillan, London. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137263070_10

⁹² Valkonen, J., & Rantanen, P. (2007). The question of seasonal migration and the practice of wild berry picking in Lapland. teoksessa Ny migration och etnicitet i Norden (2007 toim., Sivut 121-138). Åbo akademi.

⁹³ Lindner, K. and T. Kathmann (2014) Mobility partnershops and circular migration. Pp. 121-129 in J. Gertel and S. R. Sippel eds., Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh. London: Abingdon.

⁹⁴ Azzeruoli, V. (2017) The (sacred) cow business: Narratives and practices of the 'ethnic niche' of Indian Punjab milkers in the Po valley. Pp. 27-41 in A. Corrado, C. De Castro and D. Perrotta eds., Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. Abington: Routledge.





by citing the Hindu religion's reverence for cows; nevertheless, the majority of the milk workers belonged to the Sikh or Ravidassia religions, where cows are not venerated. In the same vein, hospitality sector skills, as it is perceived by employers, show an intricate "process whereby, aside from the few exceptions where technical skills are highly-valued, workers are often - and in some cases primarily - distinguished and recruited on the basis of their nationality. The importance of nationality in the selection of workers for specific work roles stems from employers' assessments of workers' attitudes and aesthetic qualities, both of which are heavily influenced by stereotyped assumptions about workers' national and cultural characteristics"⁹⁵

1.5.3. Discrimination based on the Legality of Work

In most sectors of Europe's F2F sectors, migrant labourers are directed into secondary labour markets, which itself consists of significant sub-hierarchies to which migrant workers are stratified⁹⁶:

- Employment duration (seasonality): Migrant employees on longer contracts, including those on permanent contracts, appear to do better than workers on short-term temporary contracts⁹⁷.
- 2. Level of informalization: There are various levels of informalization among migrants in secondary labour markets. Workers may occasionally, but not always, be denied the contracts to which they are constitutionally entitled. Some workers can be either semi-declared or undeclared. Yet, such stratification encompasses various dimensions beyond the absence of formal employment contracts. These can include a couple of conditions that mirror the measure by which workers' employment is formalized, regulated, and protected under

⁹⁵ Matthews, Gareth and Ruhs, Martin. (2007). Are you being served? Employer demand for migrant labour in the UK's hospitality. University of Oxford. Centre on Migration, Policy and Society Working Paper No. 51, https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/WP-2007-051-Ruhs

⁹⁶ Rye, J.F. and Scott, S., 2018. International labour migration and food production in rural Europe: A review of the evidence. Sociologia Ruralis 58(4), pp. 938-939.

⁹⁷ Gadea et al. 2017. Effects of exposure to quaternary-ammonium-based biocides on antimicrobial susceptibility and tolerance to physical stresses in bacteria from organic foods. Food Microbiology.Volume 63.p.58-71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2016.10.037





labour laws. In terms of wage practices, for instance, migrant workers might be paid under the table in cash, without proper documentation or adherence to minimum wage laws. This often means their income is not reported for taxes, and they have no official record of employment. They may also work excessively long hours without overtime pay or work under conditions that do not meet legal health and safety standards. This absence of regulation is a major aspect of informal employment.

- 3. Direct vs. indirect employment: People who are employed directly often appear to be less vulnerable than people who are self-employed or employed through labour market intermediaries. Nevertheless, the fact that there are numerous types of intermediary work (posted work) complicates the situation⁹⁸.
- 4. The type of compensation: According to Rogaly⁹⁹, piece-rate workers appear to be less fortunate than those who receive time-based compensation (daily, weekly, or monthly).

1.5.4. Discrimination based on the Legality of Stay

The migrant workforce is deeply anchored in the *secondary* segment of the F2F labour market. This labour market is further subdivided by other hierarchies based on migrant group membership. Recent empirical studies of migrant workers in the agricultural sector of the Global North underline the importance of institutional mechanisms disempowering workers. Restrictive immigration governance has been identified as a key component in disciplining migrant farmworkers, despite the fact that migrant farmworkers have organized successfully to protest against inhumane working

⁹⁸ Kilkey, M. and D. Urzi (2017) Socialreproduction in Sicily's agriculturalsector: Migration status and context of reception. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 43 (15) p. 2573-2590; Mésini, B. (2014) The transnational recruitment of temporary Latino workers in European agriculture. P. 71-82. In J. Gertel and S. R. Sippel eds., Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh. London: Abingdon; Perrotta, D. (2017) Processing tomatoes in the era of the retailing revolution. Mechanization and migrant labour in Northern and Southern Italy. P. 58-75. In A. Corrado, C. De Castro and D. Perrotta eds., Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. Abingdon: Routledge.

⁹⁹ Rogaly, B. (2008) Intensification of workplace regimes in British horticulture: The role of migrant workers. Population, Space and Place 14 (6) pp. 497-510.





and living conditions, such as migrants from South Asia and the Balkans harvesting strawberries in Greece¹⁰⁰. The legal immigrant status may not imply the assurance of labour rights. Gemi¹⁰¹, for example, illustrates how the EU's visa-free policy for Albanian migrants expands the labour pool of seasonal workers in Greek agriculture while offering no other job rights¹⁰². This semi-irregular status limits agricultural wages and lowers horticultural production costs¹⁰³.

Institutional and structural power are intertwined. In Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP), employees are only allowed to work (for the employer to whom they have been assigned. This economic dependence is not reduced by the ineffective and inconsistent role of authorities from the workers' country of origin¹⁰⁴. Melossi¹⁰⁵ observes a similar reliance on Italian employers when the state relinquishes its own decision-making power in the assignment and allocation of residence and citizenship rights, leaving it up to employers to define migrants' status and rights¹⁰⁶. In their analysis of Romanian migrant workers in Germany's agri-food sector, Cosma et al¹⁰⁷ explain the intersection of workers' institutional and economic disempowerment as a result of Big Food lobby power, employers' awareness of long-term maze of the bureaucratic infrastructure that enforces labour rules, and a lack of legal support for workers who had to confront employers for breach of contract. Several

¹⁰⁰ Papadopoulos, A.G., Fratsea, L. and Mavrommatis, G., 2018. Governing migrant labour in an intensive agricultural area in Greece: Precarity, political mobilization and migrant agency in the fields of Manolada. *Journal of Rural Studies* 64, pp. 200-209.

¹⁰¹ Gemi, E., (2017). Albanian migration in Greece: understanding irregularity in a time of cri- sis. *European* Journal of Migration and Law 19(1), pp. 12-33.

¹⁰² Papadopoulos et al. (2018: 204).

¹⁰³ Corrado, A., de Castro, C. and Perrotta, D. (2017). Cheap food, cheap labour, high profits: agriculture and mobility in the Mediterranean, in: Migration and Agriculture. Mobility and Change in the Mediterranean Area. A. Corrado, C. de Castro and D. Perrotta (Eds.), pp. 1-24, Routledge, Oxon, United Kingdom.

¹⁰⁴ Binford, A.L., (2019). Assessing temporary foreign worker programs through the prism of Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program: can they be reformed or should they be eliminated? Dialectical Anthropology 43(4), pp. 347-366.

 ¹⁰⁵ Melossi, E., (2021). 'Ghetto tomatoes' and 'taxi drivers': the exploitation and control of sub-Saharan African migrant tomato pickers in Puglia, southern Italy. *Journal of Rural Studies* 88, pp. 491-499.
 ¹⁰⁶ Melossi (2021, p. 495).

¹⁰⁷ Cosma, V.S., Ban, C. and Gabor, D., (2020). The human cost of fresh food: Romanian workers and Germany's food supply chains. *Review of Agrarian Studies* 10(2), pp. 7-27.





scholars¹⁰⁸ show that restricted migration regulation in southern Europe is intertwined with discursive conceptions of migrants as racial others in order to diminish workers' power and make them deportable. As for migrant women workers, they are restrained by gender norms, which explains the predilection of Spanish employers from Huelva for hiring migrant women with family responsibilities in order to ensure their return to their home countries when their contract expires¹⁰⁹.

Since low-wage labour is set up as standardized and easily replaceable jobs it implies it does not require unique skills. On the contrary to high-skilled labour, which appreciates the rhetoric of diversity and uniqueness¹¹⁰. McDowell et al.¹¹¹, for example, suggest in their research of migrant workers in a London hotel that employers' stereotyped conceptions about the physical attributes of (migrant) workers are what makes them acceptable for specific activities, such as front-office labour or cleaning. They demonstrate how social constructions such as "the purported compliance and deference of Indians" and "the hardworking nature of the new Polish cleaning staff" make them appealing workers for low-wage irregular employment. Employers hire lowwage irregular migrant workers because migrants are framed as "willing to work hard for low wages¹¹². Janssens and Zanoni¹¹³ and Holck and Muhr¹¹⁴ both argue that inclusion in low-wage labour necessitates confronting and countering essentialized identities of subordinate groups (such as "hard-working" or "exotic" minorities). Inclusion is about extending norms - both by recognizing minorities as whole subjects beyond stereotypes and by appreciating varied abilities.

¹⁰⁸ Melossi (2021, p. 494); Corrado et al. (2017, p. 13).

¹⁰⁹ Palumbo, L. and Sciurba, A. (2018). The Vulnerability to Exploitation of Women Migrant Workers in Agriculture in the EU: The Need for a Human Rights and Gender Based Approach. European Union, Brussels, Belgium.

¹¹⁰ Ortlieb R., Sieben B. (2010) 'Migrant Employees in Germany: Personnel Structures and Practices', Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal 29(4): 364-79.

¹¹¹ McDowell L., Batnitzky A., Dyer S. (2009) 'Division, Segmentation, and Interpellation: The Embodied Labors of Migrant Workers in a Greater London Hotel', *Economic Geography* 83(1): 1-25.

¹¹² Acker J. (2006a) *Class Questions: Feminist Answers*. Lanham: AltaMira Press.170.

 ¹¹³ anssens M., Zanoni P. (2014) 'Alternative Diversity Management: Organizational Practices Fostering Ethnic Equality at Work', Scandinavian Journal of Management30(3): 317-31.

¹¹⁴ Holck L., Muhr S. L. (2017) 'Unequal Solidarity? Towards a Norm-critical Approach to Welfare Logics', Scandinavian Journal of Management 33(1): 1-11.





1.6. Intersectional analysis of the effects of IM labour on workers

Evidence reveals that migrant workers are a group of employees who are more at risk than national workers and that the working circumstances of undocumented workers need special consideration¹¹⁵. A recent study¹¹⁶ stated that in 2018, 20% of agricultural positions in Canada were filled by temporary foreign workers. Although they are referred to as temporary employees, these migrant labourers have become Canada's main agricultural workforce over the past fifteen years. Temporary migrant workers face health hazards and inequities in this population. The COVID-19 pandemic has exacerbated many of these injustices and increased these workers' susceptibility to exploitation and risk of having their labour rights violated.

Though agriculture is unpleasant, it remains a necessary step for the labour market insertion of (rejected) asylum seekers, vulnerable European Union citizens, and irregular foreign residents. In the absence of a labour regime that protects migrants' rights and ensures incentives for their stay and settlement, there is a higher risk of engaging in exploitative, low-waged labour, which results in a higher turnover of workers and attracts an ongoing influx of new irregular migrants.

Migrant employees in informal and irregular sectors related to food are more likely to work unpaid overtime, carry out extra-contractual responsibilities, and live in unhealthy and humiliating environments. Contrary to other workers, non-nationals are at a higher risk of being exploited because accommodations and visas are frequently dependent on intermediaries like recruitment firms. Last but not least, migrant workers' rights are further challenged by the existence of dishonest private employment agencies. Paying unauthorized fees and hiring foreign workers with false representations

¹¹⁵ European Agency for Safety and Health at Work, Workforce diversity and risk assessment: Ensuring everyone is covered, p.16

¹¹⁶ Landry, V. et al. (2021). The systemized exploitation of temporary migrant agricultural workers in Canada: Exacerbation of health vulnerabilities during the COVID-19 pandemic and recommendations for the future. Journal of Migration and Health 3





about their pay, working circumstances, and place of residence are examples of unlawful behaviour.

When labour migration is fair, well-managed, and gives migrant workers access to decent work, it can be a significant development tool. Today, nearly 164 million people in the world migrate for labour but as soon as they do they become subjected to unfair labour practices and discrimination compared to national workers¹¹⁷. Levels of discriminating against non-national workers in destination countries differ from one worker to another depending on a multitude of socio-economic, legal and administrative statuses. Forced versus economic migration, permanent versus temporary stays, regular versus irregular legal status, the demographic characteristics of migrants (their age, gender, skills, among other things), and the geography of the migratory flows can all be used to categorize the utility of migrant workers. These profiles reveal how migration impacts job opportunities and how labour market segmentation strategies makes use intersectionality in its recruitment of workers.

By examining Romanian seasonal farmworkers in Germany, Cosma¹¹⁸, et al. highlight that the human cost of fresh food supply chains in Europe hinges on "cheap, non-unionized, and privately managed labour from low-wage eastern European countries". This cost manifested more clearly during the Covid-19 pandemic which had a dual effect on migrant farmworkers. It exacerbated the structural precarity and disempowerment of migrant farmworkers but it also made their work and contributions visible and gave them a margin of negotiation and collective action for better labour conditions. To close the gap on the severity of food insecurity on one's health and wellbeing during migration or when people are 'on the move', Orjuela-Grimm et al.¹¹⁹ make use of an interdisciplinary and intersectional approach that considers the

¹¹⁷ Amo-Agyei, Silas. 2020 (check). The migrant pay gap: Understanding wage differences between migrants and nationals. ILO: Swizerland. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/--protrav/---migrant/documents/publication/wcms_763803.pdf

¹¹⁸ Cosma, V. S., Ban, C & Gabor, D. (2020). The Human Cost of Fresh Food: Romanian Workers and Germany's Food Supply Chains. Review of Agrarian Studies 10 (2), pp.7-27

¹¹⁹ Orjuela-Grimm, M. et al. (2022). Migrants on the Move and Food (In)security: A Call for Research. Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health 24 (5), pp.1318-1327





repercussions of the intersection of active mobility with food security on migrants' health and wellbeing. Park and Kim's¹²⁰ study evaluated how different employment statuses expose workers to different work stressors and demands different responses to those stressors and thereby affect workers' psychological well-being in different ways.

There is an intersection between low-waged, agricultural work and living conditions¹²¹. As mentioned and opposed to other sectors, agricultural sector is marked by recruitment through informal channels. This reality represents a chance for arrived migrants to gain even minimum remuneration in their initial phase of stay. However, low wages together with their status of irregularity prevent them from affording a shelter or access to different services, ended up in awful living conditions which involve the growth of shantytowns¹²² Vagrancy¹²³. In Huelva for instance, workers live "in a migrant settlement away from water and live without electricity or adequate sanitation¹²⁴". Because of their status of irregularity, these workers endure the largest burden of the working and living conditions particularly prevalent, according to social organization reports, in Andalusian provinces of Almeria and Huelva where dangers of fire have led to the death of many workers.

The pandemic further inflamed the question of health in the intersection of the different axes of social divisions. In Huelva, women in particular suffered from a situation of extreme vulnerability caused by health issues (e.g. cases of cancer, chronic kidney failure or hernias) with no support from their employers¹²⁵. As in other EU labour markets, the working conditions of migrants in the Spanish labour market are

¹²⁰ Park, J and Kim, Y. (2020). Workers with Different Employment Status Have Different Exposures to Work Stressors and Different Responses to Identical Work Stressors. Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine 62 (12), pp.e710-e715

 ¹²¹ López-Sala, A. & Molinero-Gerbeau, Y. (2022). Intersections_of_Precariousness Vulnerability and Quality of Life of Migrants with Irregular Status https://www.researchgate.net/publication/361208583.
 ¹²² Fecons (2017).

¹²³ Achón, O. (2014). "Desvagabundizando La Mano de Obra Extranjera En España." Revista de Estudios Sociales, 48: 69-83.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

¹²⁵ Inter-professional association of the strawberry.





repercussive¹²⁶. Migrants in irregular status go beyond what is called "precariat"¹²⁷, wading into a full-fledged labour and social subalternity¹²⁸. Structural pressure emanated from the dilemma of irregularity, stress, fatigue, exploitation, dehumanization and further damages like death as it was the extreme case of a Nicaraguan worker, Eleazar Blandón, who died in August 2020 in Lorca, Murcia¹²⁹.

Medland's¹³⁰ ethnographic study on agri-food workers from the region of Chtouka Ait Baha¹³¹ in Morocco considers three time-related pressures on migrant workers. The first is represented in nature's time, related to seasonality, daylight and the weather. The second is the industrial time, related to the market. The third is the socialreproductive time, related to domestic care responsibilities. The study illustrates that the three time pressures lead to migrant workers' exhaustion and immobility "Within enclaves of agri-food production, where seasons last for long periods of the year, immobility is therefore a feature of workers' lives in the long run, as is mobility¹³²".

1.7. An Intersectional understanding of forms of IM workers' agency

While it is worthwhile to make visible the inequalities and challenges that migrant workers encounter in the labour market, it is very important to recognise that experiences of exploitation intersect with those of empowerment. Therefore, the workplace can be the space of resistance in which "'even the most seemingly 'powerless' individuals are able to mobilise resources whereby they carve out spaces of control¹³³". The migrant worker activism has been rarely explored by the broader

¹²⁶ Avallone, G. (2014). "Migraciones y Agricultura En Europa Del Sur: Emergencia de Un Nuevo Proletariado Internacional." Migraciones Internacionales, 27: 137-69.

¹²⁷ Standing, Guy. (2011). The Precariat. The New Dangerous Class. London and New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

¹²⁸ Caruso, F. (2015). La Politica Dei Subalterni. Organizzazione e Lotte Del Bracciantato Migrante Nel Sud Europa. Roma: DeriveApprodi.

 ¹²⁹ A report from the part of national press indicates that this worker used to work 11 hours per day under
 40 Celsius degrees for a salary of 30 euros per day.

¹³⁰ Medland, L. (2021). 'There is no time': Agri-food internal migrant workers in Morocco's tomato industry. Journal of Rural Studies 88, pp.482-490.

¹³¹ The region is known as a region where agri-food is produced at industrial scale for export.

¹³² Ibid.

¹³³Giddens, A. (1982) *Profiles and Critiques in Social Theory*. London: Macmillan. pp 197.





literature within social movement studies, mainly because dominant theories like resource mobilisation and opportunity structure approach view migrants as non-controversial participants, attributing it to legal hurdles, resources constraints, and restricted political discursive chances they encounter¹³⁴.

Mobilizations are seen as "an anomaly" within the existing literature¹³⁵. However, different forms of migrant activism have gained interest among researchers in the field of social movements, particularly during the "long summer of migration" scenario in recent years¹³⁶. While some scholars have even acknowledged their neglect of migrant activism in the past, considering it a significant blank space in the field¹³⁷, others have emphasised the potential contributions that the study of collective actions initiated by migrant workers can offer to the social movements as an area of research¹³⁸.

In the early 2010s, the necessity for a dialogue on migrant activism became the focal point of interest, accentuating the limited intersection between social movement studies and migration studies¹³⁹. After certain ground-breaking research¹⁴⁰, Isin's involvement in the realm of "acts of citizenship"¹⁴¹ has stood out, influencing recent literature on mobilisation by undocumented migrants, anti-deportation movements, and

¹³⁴ Steinhilper, E. (2018). Mobilizing in transnational contentious spaces: linking relations, emotions and space in migrant activism. *Social Movement Studies*, *17* (5), 574-591.

¹³⁵ Steinhilper, E. (2021). *Migrant Protest. Interactive Dynamics in Precarious Mobilizations*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

¹³⁶De la Porta, D. (2018). Solidarity Mobilizations in the "Refugee Crisis". Contentious Moves. London: Palgrave. Nicholls, W. and Uitermark, J. (2017). Cities and Social Movements: Immigrant Rights Activism in the United States, France, and the Netherlands, 1970- 2015. New York: John Wiley & sons.

¹³⁷ Eggert, N., and Giugni, M. (2015). Migration and Social Movements. In D. della Porta and M. Diani (Ed), The Oxford Handbook of Social Movements (pp. 159-172). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

¹³⁸ Mora, M., et al. (2018). Immigrant rights and social movements. Sociology Compass, 12, (8), e2599.

¹³⁹ Basok, T. (2010). Opening a Dialogue on Migrant (Rights) Activism. Studies in Social Justice, 4 (2), 97-100. https://doi.org/10.26522/ssj.v4i2.996

 ¹⁴⁰ Mezzadra, S. (2004). The Right to Escape. Ephemera. Theory and Politics in organization, 4(3), 267-275. Tyler, I. and Marciniak, K. (Ed.)(2014). Protesting Citizenship: Migrant Activisms. London: Routledge.

 ¹⁴¹ Isin, E. (2008). Theorizing acts of citizenship. In E. Isin and G. Nielsen (Ed.), Acts of Citizenship (pp. 15-43). London: Palgrave Macmillan.





resistance against border regimes¹⁴². Despite efforts to bridge these fields¹⁴³, research is still disjointed, with common themes revolving around labour rights, legal status and citizenship for undocumented migrants and refugees, anti-internment and anti-deportation movements, border regimes, the "right to the city," and more recently, civil society solidarity.

Because there has been a predominant focus on urban perspectives, recent analysis of migrant activism acknowledges the necessity of incorporating diverse "geographic settings"¹⁴⁴. Limited research has explored the mobilisation of seasonal workers in agricultural enclaves, primarily addressed in rural studies. Scholars from North American and Southern European countries, experiencing significant growth in agro-industrial enclaves, have delved into the struggles of migrant workers¹⁴⁵. These contributions emphasise challenges faced by seasonal agricultural migrants, arising from factors such as irregular status, temporary employment, accommodation segregation, and social

¹⁴² McNevin, A. (2011). Contesting Citizenship: Irregular Migrants and New Frontiers of the Political. New York: Columbia University Press. Nyers, P. and Rygiel, K (2012). Citizenship, migrant activism and the politics of movement. London: Routledge. Barbero, I. (2012). Expanding Acts of Citizenship: The Struggles of Sinpapeles Migrants. Social & Legal Studies, 21 (4), 529-547. https://doi. org/10.1177/0964663912455944. Ataç, I., Rygiel, K. and Stierl, M. (Eds) (2017). The Contentious Politics of Refugee and Migrant Protest and Solidarity Movements: Remaking Citizenship from the Margins. Basingstoke: Routledge.

¹⁴³Steinhilper, E. (2021). Migrant Protest. Interactive Dynamics in Precarious Mobilizations. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press. Bloemraad, I. and Voss, K. (2020) Movement or moment? Lessons from the pro-immigrant movement in the United States and contemporary challenges. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 46 (4), 683-704. https://doi.org/10.1080/136918 3X.2018.1556447.

¹⁴⁴ Schmid-Scott, A., Marshall, E., Gill, N. & Bagelman, J. (2020). Rural Geographies of Refugee Activism: The Expanding Spaces of Sanctuary in the UK. *Revue européenne des migrations internationales*, 36 (2-3), 137-160.

 ¹⁴⁵Corrado, A. (2011). Clandestini in the Orange Towns: Migrations and Racisms in Calabria's Agriculture. *Race/Ethnicity 4*, (2), 191-201. Caruso, F. (2016). Migration and Agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. Editors: Corrado A., De Castro C., Perrotta D. Routledge. (pp.277-292). Choudry A. and Thomas, M. (2013). Labour struggles for workplace justice: Migrant and immigrant worker organizing in Canada. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, *55*(2), 212-226. https://doi. org/10.1177/0022185612473215. Avallone, G. (2017). The land of informal intermediation: The social regulation of migrant agricultural labour in the Piana del Sele, Italy. Pp. 2017-2230 in A. Corrado, C. De Castro and D. Perrotta eds., Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area (Abingdon: Routledge). Rye, J. F. and Scott, S. (2018). International Labour Migration and Food Production in Rural Europe: A Review of the Evidence. *Sociologia Ruralis*, 58 (4), 928-952. https://doi.org/10.1111/soru.12208





isolation. Despite constraints, some contexts foster connections and coalitions with other migrant collectives or civil society actors, supporting mobilisation¹⁴⁶.

Previous research¹⁴⁷ suggest that even in the most marginalized places, people are able to take part in minor acts of empowerment. For instance, Gertel and Sippel¹⁴⁸ argue that seasonal workers should be seen as actors with a range of control rather than only as victims. As a result, it is crucial to recognise that most workers are capable of making small but sometimes very significant changes in the micro-spaces of their places of employment and daily living, even though they do so in a world where capital rules¹⁴⁹.

Intersectionally speaking, undocumented migrants who work in the restaurant and takeaway sectors show capacities to make choices and exert influence within their limited and often precarious circumstances. These irregular migrant workers play a critical role in the industry of hospitality, yet, because of their legal status, they encounter intricate challenges. There are several examples of literature that probe into agency among these irregular migrant workers in the hospitality sector, particularly highlighting how food gets onto our plates. Bloch and Mcklay¹⁵⁰, for instance, offer valuable insights into the broader food industry, encompassing the important yet often unnoticed contributions of undocumented workers such as their courage of forming and joining unions and advocacy groups, notwithstanding the risks of deportation or employer retaliation. These workers tend to negotiate better terms with their

¹⁴⁶ Papadopoulos, A., Fratsea, L., & Mavrommatis, G. (2018). Governing migrant labour in an intensive agricultural area in Greece: Precarity, political mobilization and migrant agency in the fields of Manolada. *Journal of Rural Studies, 64*, 200-209. DOI: 10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.03.013

¹⁴⁷ Rogaly, Ben. (2009). Spaces of Work and Everyday Life: Labour Geographies and the Agency of Unorganised Temporary Migrant Workers. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8198.2009.00290.x Rogaly, B., & Qureshi, K. (2016). That's where my perception of it all was shattered': Oral histories and moral geographies of food sector workers in an English city region. Geoforum. 10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.03.003. Scott, James C. (1985). Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance. Yale University Press.

¹⁴⁸ Gertel, J. and Sippel, S.R. (Eds) (2014). Seasonal Workers in Mediterranean Agriculture the Social Costs of Eating Fresh. London: Routledge.

¹⁴⁹ Rogaly, B. (2009). Spaces of Work and Everyday Life: Labour Geographies and the Agency of Unorganised Temporary Migrant Workers. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8198.2009.00290.x

¹⁵⁰https://www.researchgate.net/publication/273364790_Hidden_DishesHow_Food_Gets_on_to_Our_Plate s_Undocumented_Migrants_and_the_Restaurant_and_Takeaway_Sector





employers, leveraging their skills or the demands for their labour to improve their wages or working conditions. Undocumented workers' exercise of agency includes building supportive networks within their communities as well. They assist each other navigate the challenges of living and working without legal status through sharing information related to resources, jobs and rights.

In the context of legal advocacy, some undocumented workers take risks to engage in legal action against exploitative employers, participating in lawsuits to declare unpaid wages or inveigh against abusive working conditions. This form of agency is considered powerful as it seeks to challenge injustice and long for protection through the legal system. Furthermore, these undocumented workers contribute, beyond the economic realm, to the cultural and social fabric of their communities. They participate in social events, religious activities, and community services, which catalyses a form of social agency and resilience.

Besides, the repercussions brought about by the Covid-19 pandemic triggers migrant workers' consciousness on the importance of their contribution in ensuring food security. This intriguing awareness increased in the absence of positive feedback from respective governments which fuelled a political debates and mobilisation over the regularisation of legal status. The most influential form of collective activism shaped by different migrants is exemplified by Agricultural day labourers which was part of the regularisation movement witnessed in May 2020¹⁵¹. For instance, Regularización YA movement¹⁵² was the epitome of an urgent call for regularization that has been constantly addressed by seasonal workers themselves as dynamic actors during 2022. In the context of socio-health exigencies related to Huelva camps, access to water was

¹⁵¹ López-Sala, A. (2021). Luchando por sus derechos en tiempos de COVID-19. Resistencias y reclamaciones de regularización de los migrantes sinpapeles en España. *Revista Interdisciplinar da Mobilidade Humana*, 29 (61), 83-96. https://doi. org/10.1590/1980-85852503880006106

¹⁵² López-Sala, A. (2021). Luchando por sus derechos en tiempos de COVID-19. Resistencias y reclamaciones de regularización de los migrantes sinpapeles en España. *Revista Interdisciplinar da Mobilidade Humana, 29* (61), 83-96; López-Sala, A. (2022). Voices from the fields. Migrant agriculture workers during Covid-19 in Spain and new forms of activism for dignity. *Estudios Geográficos, 83* (293), e107. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022113.113.





needed to appease the dignity of residents of informal settlements¹⁵³.

In addition, the New Citizens for interculturality association (ASNUCI) brought into existence by African seasonal workers against the backdrop of indifference to stand up for the rights of workers living in settlements followed by a remedial action which entailed the construction of homes for these workers¹⁵⁴. Practically, mobilizations targeted the regularizations of precarious status, alarming housing conditions, labour exploitation, health and safety issue. Through the "Solución Asentamientos" platform, several associations of seasonal workers and civil society actors gathered during the summer of 2020 in front of the town hall to express disapproval of further manifestation of the government's inefficacy in regularization.

Other examples from the literature of temporary and seasonal workers in the food industry banding together to jointly oppose the mechanisms that support their marginality and taking collective action include¹⁵⁵:

- The 'Codetras' network in France: the *Collectif de Défense des Travailleurs Etrangers Saisonniers dans l'Agriculture* (Collective for the Defence of Foreign Agricultural Workers)¹⁵⁶
- The El Ejido protest in Spain: this is the Spanish town from where Moroccan workers went on strike in response to anti-immigrant riots and sentiment in 2000.
- The SOC union in Spain: the establishment of the Sindicato de Obreros del Campo union made up of day labourers based in Andalusia, Spain.

¹⁵³ García Padilla, F., et al. (2021). Condiciones de vida y salud de la población inmigrante en los asentamientos de Huelva. *Revista Española de Salud Pública*, *95*, 1-17.

¹⁵⁴ López-Sala, A. (2022). Voices from the fields. Migrant agriculture workers during Covid-19 in Spain and new forms of activism for dignity. *Estudios Geográficos*, 83 (293), e107. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022113.113

¹⁵⁵ Rye, J.F. & Scott, S., 2018. International labour migration and food production in rural Europe: A review of the evidence. *Sociologia Ruralis* 58(4), pp. 938-939.

¹⁵⁶Gertel, J. & Sippel, S.R. (Ed.) (2014). Seasonal Workers in Mediterranean Agriculture the Social Costs of Eating Fresh. London: Routledge.p. 45-47.





- The unofficial Nardò strike in Italy: this is a small agricultural town in the Apulia in response to exploitative conditions and the *caporal* (gangmaster) system.
- "Jornaleras de Huelva en Lucha"¹⁵⁷ represents a movement geared towards the rights and conditions of female agriculture workers in the Huelva province of Spain. It gained attention for highlighting the multiple practices of exploitation including sexual harassment. The actions often involve public protests, legal challenges, and awareness campaigns aimed at both the Spanish authorities and the international community, looking forward to make a change in both local labour practices and social attitudes towards migrant and female workers¹⁵⁸.
- The Swedish berry picker marches, and associated union action, of 2010¹⁵⁹.
- The association 'Plataforma Fruita amb Justícia Social' held in the province of Lleida (Spain) was born with a campaign to propose the creation of a seal of quality fruit that guarantees the social and labour rights of temporary workers and immigrants, similar as the seal 'bio' or 'eco'. Apart from this campaign, it works to improve the labour conditions of agricultural workers in Catalonia¹⁶⁰.

The smoothness of such mobilizations were tightened by perpetual hindrance as they do not seem to adequately create the form of efficient activism¹⁶¹. These collective forms of agency of migrant workers via networks, protests, union action, unofficial strikes and marches demonstrate that extremely underprivileged migrants do have

¹⁵⁷ Day Laborers of Huelva in Struggle

¹⁵⁸ Güell, Berta (2022). Intersectionality meets seasonal agricultural work: the case of Huelva in times of COVID-19. Estudios Geográficos, 83 (293), e113. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022119.119.

¹⁵⁹ Nedžad M. & Wikström, E. (2021). Ruptures and acts of citizenship in the Swedish berry-picking industry. Journal of Rural Studies, Volume 88, p 154-156.

¹⁶⁰ https://fruitaambjusticia.wordpress.com

¹⁶¹ López-Sala, A. (2022). Voices from the fields. Migrant agriculture workers during Covid-19 in Spain and new forms of activism for dignity. *Estudios Geográficos*, 83 (293), e107. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022113.113





agency. Drawing on postcolonial feminist research¹⁶², we know that though experiences of oppressive conditions and their representations are complex and multifaceted, oppressed workers can actually have an active role, fighting back, creating spaces for resistance, which, however, can also reproduce other oppressive conditions.

Siegmann¹⁶³ et al. highlight that migrant farm workers experience "regulated precarity" or insecurities that are both sanctioned and influenced by the prevailing regulation. In such a particular economic and societal setting, the "*power resources approach*" focuses on the tools employees dispose of to advance their class interests. Bieler¹⁶⁴ situates the theory in the broader Marxist political economy literature where agency is being given more and more weight. Wright¹⁶⁵, who is largely credited with creating the approach, defines power as "the ability of individuals and organizations to realize class interests." Standing¹⁶⁶ stated that the tensions of differences within the migrant workers or what he calls the *precariat* (new rising heterogeneous groups of mobile low-waged workers) creates internal dialectical debates and cracks to the unity of interests needed for a collective consciousness, which makes it difficult for the precariat to forge a political strategy to move and fight back for their rights.

¹⁶² Abu-Lughod, L. (1990). The romance of resistance: tracing transformations of power through Bedouin women. American Ethnologist, 17, 41-55. Fleming, P., & Spicer, A. (2014). Power in Management and Organization Science. The Academy of Management Annals, 8, 237-298.

¹⁶³ Siegmann, K. A., et al. (2022). Migrant labour in Dutch agriculture: Regulated precarity. European Journal of Migration and Law, 24(2), 217-240. https://doi.org/10.1163/15718166-12340127

¹⁶⁴ Bieler, A., (2018). Agency and the power resources approach: Asserting the importance of the structuring conditions of the capitalist social relations of production. *Global Labour Journal* 9(2), pp. 243-248.

¹⁶⁵ Wright, E.O. (2000). Working-class power, capitalist-class interests, and class compromise. *American Journal of Sociology* 105(4), pp. 957-1002.

¹⁶⁶ Standing, G. (2011). *The Precariat: the new dangerous class*. Bloomsbury Academic, London and New York, United Kingdom and United States, pp. 10-13.





2. Methodological considerations

2.1. Incorporating intersectionality across the project's WPs

Under this section, several indicators and key questions will be developed to review how intersectionality can be included in the research design of each WP. Some broad criteria should be kept in mind while incorporating the intersectional perspective into the project and its respective WPs' methodological designs. Namely, it should be incorporated in the WP3 EU legal analysis, and in the WP4 and WP5 national and local policy analysis, but also in WP6 and WP7 analysis of employers and employees' spheres. Furthermore, intersectional analysis should be considered while designing the sample of the large-scale survey, interviews, workshops, and focus groups. This means that, whenever possible, an intersectional lens should be applied, so that both the triggers and outcomes of migrant workers' irregularities are well understood and contextualized. Of course, each environment and case study will influence the applications of the intersectional approach. Finally, the intersectional perspective should be present not just during the data collection process, but also during data analysis, interpretation and outputs (reports, working papers, policy briefs, etc.)

To conduct an intersectional status-disaggregated analysis, three steps can be pursued:

Step 1: explore the prevalence of precarious labour conditions among regular and irregular migrant workers (status-disaggregated analysis)

Step 2: explore the prevalence of precarious labour conditions among different groups of regular and irregular migrant workers and analyse their **inter-group differences** in terms of the typology of their irregularity (at stay and at work) and how it intersects with other demographic variables such as gender, nationality, education, et. to create various taxonomies of irregularity and various categories of migrant workers (each with specific and unique exploitative work conditions). Focus here should be on comparing differences between categories of regular and irregular migrant workers. (intersectional status-disaggregated analysis)





Step 3: explore **intra-group differences** among regular and irregular low-waged migrant workers using one demographic variable. For example, migrant workers with have temporary labour status can be disaggregated by gender, education, nationality, or race, etc.

In terms of the sampling criteria and data sources, an intersectionality approach in the selection of case studies would mean selecting cases that represent variability of profiles including regular, irregular migrant workers, and nationals besides other context-dependent variables, such as gender, race, nationality, etc. Likewise, the composition of the participants of the surveys, interviews and focus groups, etc. should ensure that participants present a variability of profiles including regular and irregular migrant workers and other context-dependent variables, e.g., gender, nationality, etc. As for the inclusion of intersectionality in the analysis of data, the theoretical part of these guidelines provides a useful theoretical framework.

Depending on the focus and objective of each WP, the use of *inter-group comparisons* and *intra-group comparisons* is important. *Inter-group comparisons* between the various groups of workers in terms of their legal and administrative statuses, i.e. irregular migrant workers, regular migrant workers, and national workers would for instance would provide an understanding of the difference in terms of the legal labour entitlements of each group. As for *intra-group differences*, which rather focus on the internal micro-differences among one category of workers, it would shed light on how the legal and administrative status along with the other identity, demographic and socio-economic markers of a specific sub-category would produce favourable or unfavourable work conditions and entitlements.





2.2. Dimensions, indicators and key questions

Dimensions	Indicators	Key questions
Cross-cutting W	'Ps	
Decent work	Legal status & Administrative status	- How can policies urge employers to act fairly and ethically towards migrant workers, fomenting a culture of respect and equality in the workplace regardless of their status, gender, race, nationality, etc.?
Precariousness	socio-economic statuses: -Gender -Nationality -Education, etc. Conditions of work	 To what extent migrant workers resist their working conditions in response to the unfair treatment at work? Is equal treatment extended to IM workers with respect to protection of their human rights, and labour standards regardless of their legal, administrative or socio-economic status? What legal protection measures ensure equal treatment of migrant workers at work ?
WP2		
Gender, Intersectionali ty, and Occupational Health	Gender- responsive measures to counter exploitation Irregularity in migration status Occupational health	 Are there any policy measures to counter exploitative and abusive work relationships, violence, and harassment, including gender-based violence against migrant workers? What intersections of identity markers (legal, economic or social status markers) make irregular migrant workers more vulnerable and prey to exploitation and forced labour? Does the legislative framework on occupational safety and health provide protections to migrant workers? Which measures are available for diagnosis, prevention, care, rehabilitation and compensation of occupational diseases and injuries at work?
WP3		
Crafting the regulatory infrastructure at the EU level	-Patterns of Irregularity at work -Discrimination on the basis of: - Legal status -Administrative status - Gender - Nationality - Age, etc.	 - How do the seemingly neutral EU legal and policy frameworks co-create systemic intersectional discriminations and inequalities in precarious labour positions based on the intersection of migrant workers' administrative/legal status along with their gender, race, nationality, etc.? - What effects can legislation have on categories of irregular migrant workers, such as seasonal workers with a long term status and others with a short term status and others with irregular status? - What areas are left unregulated regarding migrant labour? How do these legal gaps intersect with issues





WP4	Implicit or explicit policies addressing IM work - Blind spots in policies	 of race, gender and immigration status? Which categories benefit from these regulatory oversights, and which rights remain undermined? Does EU Level Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), through legal or moral obligations, offer a useful tool to enhance the protection of IMs irrespective of their status, gender, class, nationality, ethnicity, etc.?
Crafting and implementatio n of regulatory infrastructure at the national level	-General and Sector-specific policies addressing IM work (across the policy cycle): - Agenda setting - Policy formulation - Policy implementat ion	 To what extent intersectional inequalities are considered when setting the agenda on decent migrant work in F2F sectors? Do general and F2F sectoral public policies address the conditions and rights of (ir)regular migrant workers?
		 Whose interests are taken into consideration in the general and sector specific public policies addressing IM work?
		- Are these policies sensitive to the composite vulnerabilities of categories of irregular migrant workers, their gender, legal status, nationality, education, age, etc.?
		 How do seemingly neutral national regulations and policies co-create (in practice) systemic intersectional discrimination and inequalities in precarious labour positions based on migrants' administrative/legal status, gender, race, nationality, etc.?
WP5		
Implementatio n of regulatory infrastructure at the local level (in practice)	Local governance structures IM workers	 How do seemingly neutral practices in local governance structures co-create systemic intersectional discriminations and inequalities based on migrant's administrative/legal status, gender, race, nationality, etc.?
	survival strategies	 What socio-legal and economic identity markers make IM workers more prey to precariousness? Who are their allies?
		 How would an intersectional approach to the inclusion of IM workers work out in practice? What strategies IM workers use to negotiate their
		entitlements to labour rights and social services?
		 How does intersecting identities influence the work experiences of migrant workers?
WP6	Employers'	
Employer reliance on migrant labour	Employers' identity and experience with IM workers	- Why do employers rely on IMs workers and which migrant workers are targeted in the low-skilled labour market?
		 What function does intersectionality have in the enforcement of regulatory frameworks by employers?





Navigating the regulatory infrastructure by employers	The size of the enterprise (small enterprises tend to rely on informal labour) The number of IM workers involved	 How do employers navigate the regulatory infrastructure to promote safer and healthier working environments considering the intersecting identities of their workforce? Which categories of IM workers are favoured and why? And in which sector there is an employers' dependence on IM workers? Would an employer with a migration background act differently than an employer without a migration background? How do intersecting social identities shape the implementation and effectiveness of workplace governance measures designed by employers, and what are the potential biases or gaps in these regulations? What categories of IM workers are favoured in franchises and independently owned enterprises?
WP7	<u> </u>	
Irregular migrant mobilisations and agency Navigating the regulatory infrastructure by migrants	Individual forms of agency of IM workers vary	 What intersectional identity markers increase or decrease exposure to precarious F2F labour conditions?
	with each one's status and intersectional identities Forms of IM workers organizing against precariousness and exploitation	 How do intersectional identity markers affect migrant worker's response and coping mechanisms with regards to labour precarity/ irregularity?
		 To what extent intersecting factors of seasonality and spatial workplace dynamics influence the experiences and treatment of IM workers, considering their diverse identities?
		 How do IM workers, across their intersectional identities, organize themselves individually and collectively to stretch their entitlements and rights? Who are their adversaries and who are their allies?
	IM workers' allies and adversaries	 What coping mechanisms do IMs use to challenge and change any neo-liberal, post-colonial, sexist and/ or racist discriminatory policies, practices, and cultural perceptions inflicted upon them?
WP8		
Dissemination Communicatio n of projects results Impact	inclusive and diverse dissemination of the project Scientific publications Project's website Conferences participations	 How does the dissemination of the projects' activities and results cater for the needs of the population target, IM workers?
		 Do the project dissemination activities and outputs reflect IM workers' perspectives and expectations of the impact of the research?
		 Do these activities help in changing the narrative about IM workers and improving their labour rights and entitlements?





References

- Abu-Lughod, L. (1990). The romance of resistance: Tracing transformations of power through Bedouin women. *American Ethnologist*, *17*, 41-55.
- Achón, O. (2014). Desvagabundizando La Mano de Obra Extranjera En España [Dismantling Foreign Labor in Spain]. Revista de Estudios Sociales, 48, 69-83.
- Acker J. (2006a). Class questions: Feminist answers. AltaMira Press.
- Acker, J. (2006b). Inequality regimes: Gender, class, and race in organizations. *Gender* & Society, 20, 441-464. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243206289499
- Adam, I., Agyeiwaah, E. & Dayour, F. (2023). Migrant worker inclusion and psychological well-being: Insights from the hospitality and tourism workplace. Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management, 55, 448-459.
- Afonja, S. (1981). Changing modes of production and the sexual division of labor among the Yoruba. *Signs*, 7(2), 299-313.
- Alberti, G., et al. (2018). In, against and beyond precarity: Work in insecure times. Work, *Employment and Society*, 32(3), 447-57.
- Amnesty International. (2012). Exploited labour. Migrant workers in Italy's agricultural sector. Amnesty International, www.amnesty.org/en/documents/EUR30/020/2012/en/
- Amo-Agyei, S. (2020). The migrant pay gap: Understanding wage differences between migrants and nationals. *ILO* : Switzeland. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/---protrav/--migrant/documents/publication/wcms_763803.pdf
- Anthias, F. (2013). Hierarchies of social location, class and intersectionality: Towards a translocational frame. *International Sociology*, 28(1), 121-138. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580912463155</u>
- Ataç, I., Rygiel, K. & Stierl, M. (Eds.). (2017). The contentious politics of refugee and migrant protest and solidarity movements: Remaking citizenship from the margins. Routledge.
- Avallone, G. (2014). Migraciones y Agricultura En Europa Del Sur: Emergencia de Un Nuevo Proletariado Internacional [Migrations and Agriculture in Southern Europe: Emergence of a New International Proletariat]. Migraciones Internacionales, 27, 137-69.
- Avallone, G. (2017). The land of informal intermediation: The social regulation of migrant agricultural labour in the Piana del Sele, Italy. In A. Corrado, C. de Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area*. Routledge.





Axelsson, L. & Hedberg, C. (2018a). Emerging topologies of transnational employment: 'Posting' Thai workers in Sweden's wild berry industry beyond regulatory reach. *Geoforum*, 89, 1-10.

- Axelsson, M. & Hedberg, L. (2018b). Innovations in environmental science. Environmental Press.
- Azzeruoli, V. (2017). The (sacred) cow business: Narratives and practices of the 'ethnic niche' of Indian Punjab milkers in the Po valley. In A. Corrado, C. De Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area* (pp. 27-41). Routledge.
- Baglioni, E., Campling, L., Coe, N. M., & Smith, A. (2022). Introduction: Labour regimes and global production. In E. Baglioni, L. Campling, Coe, N. M. & A. Smith (Eds.), Labour regimes and global production. Agenda Publishing.
- Baglioni, E., Campling, L., Mezzadri, A., Miyamura, S., Pattenden, J. & Selwyn, B. (2018) Exploitation and labour regimes: A Research 16 Agenda', paper presented at the Global Conference on Economic Geography, Cologne, July.
- Bandana, P. (2010). Interrogating intersectionality: Contemporary globalisation and racialised gendering in the lives of highly educated South Asian Americans and their children. Journal of Intercultural Studies, 31(1), 29-47, 10.1080/07256860903477696
- Barbero, I. (2012). Expanding acts of citizenship: The struggles of Sinpapeles migrants. Social & Legal Studies, 21(4), 529-547. https://doi. org/10.1177/0964663912455944
- Barthold, C., Krawczyk, V. & Priola, V. (2022). Intersectionality on screen. A coloniality perspective to understand popular culture representations of intersecting oppressions at work. *Gender Work And Organization*, 29(6), 1890-1909.
- Basok, T. (2010). Opening a dialogue on migrant (rights) activism. Studies in Social Justice, 4(2), 97-100. <u>https://doi.org/10.26522/ssj.v4i2.996</u>
- Bastia, T. (2014). Intersectionality, migration and development. *Progress in Development Studies*, <u>14(3)</u>, 237-248. 10.1177/1464993414521330
- Bastia, T. (2019). Gender, migration and social transformation: Intersectionality in Bolivian itinerant migrations. Routledge.
- Bieler, A. (2018). Agency and the power resources approach: Asserting the importance of the structuring conditions of the capitalist social relations of production. *Global Labour Journal*, 9(2), 243-248.
- Binford, A. L. (2019). Assessing temporary foreign worker programs through the prism of Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program: Can they be reformed or should they be eliminated? *Dialectical Anthropology*, 43(4), 347-366.





- Blair, J. (2022a). Gendered labour regimes in global production. In E. Baglioni, L. Campling, Coe, N. M. & A. Smith (Eds.), Labour regimes and global production (pp. 29-44). Agenda Publishing.
- Blair, T. (2022b). Modern challenges in urban planning. City Development Publications.
- Bloemraad, I. & Voss, K. (2020). Movement or moment? Lessons from the pro-immigrant movement in the United States and contemporary challenges. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *46*(4), 683-704. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/136918</u> <u>3X.2018.1556447</u>
- Boeckler, M. & Berndt, C. (2014). B/Ordering Mediterranean: Free trade, fresh fruits and fluid fixity. In J. Gertel & S. R. Sippel (Eds.), Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh (pp. 23-34). Routledge.
- Burawoy, M. (1985). The politics of production: Factory regimes under capitalism and socialism. Verso.
- Cañada, E. (2019). El trabajo de las camareras de piso: un estado de la cuestión [The work of the bedrooms: A stage of the question]. Papers de Turisme, 62, 67-84.
- Caruso, F. (2015). La Politica Dei Subalterni. Organizzazione e Lotte Del Bracciantato Migrante Nel Sud Europa [The Politics of the Subaltern. Organization and Struggles of Migrant Laborers in Southern Europe]. DeriveApprodi.
- Caruso, F. (2016). Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area. In A. Corrado, C. de Castro, & D. Perrotta (Eds.), (pp. 277-292). Routledge.
- Choudry A. & Thomas, M. (2013). Labour struggles for workplace justice: Migrant and immigrant worker organizing in Canada. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 55(2), 212-226. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022185612473215
- Choudry A. & Thomas, M. (2013). Labour struggles for workplace justice: Migrant and immigrant worker organizing in Canada. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 55(2), 212-226. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022185612473215
- Cillo, R. & T. Toffanin. (2014). Corporate Social Responsibility to prevent human trafficking. Immigrant Workers in Italian Agriculture. A Mapping. University of Venice.
- Colectivo de Investigación Arosa Sun. (2020). Explotación de la nueva emigración española en el corazón logístico de Europa [Exploitation of the new Spanish emigration in the logistical heart of Europe]. https://digitum.um.es/digitum/bitstream/10201/110735/1/InformeHol..0.pdf Collins, P. H. & Bilge, S. (2016). Malden: Polity Press.
- Corrado, A. (2011). Clandestini in the Orange Towns: Migrations and racisms in Calabria's agriculture. *Race/Ethnicity*, *4*(2), 191-201.





- Corrado, A., de Castro, C. & Perrotta, D. (2017a). Cheap food, cheap labour, high profits: Agriculture and mobility in the Mediterranean. In A. Corrado, C. de Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area* (pp. 1-24), Routledge.
- Corrado, A., de Castro, C. & Perrotta, D. (2017b). *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area*. Routledge.
- Cosma, V. S., Ban, C. & Gabor, D. (2020). The human cost of fresh food: Romanian workers and Germany's food supply chains. *Review of Agrarian Studies*, 10(2), 7-27.
- Crenn, C. (2017) Wine heritage and ethnicization of labour: Arab workers in the Bordeaux vineyards. In A. Corrado, C. de Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area*. Routledge.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics.
- Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford Law Review* <u>43(6)</u>, 1241-1299. 10.2307/1229039
- Darhour, H. (2020). "Whose empowerment? Gender Quota Reform Mechanisms and Dedemocratization in Morocco". In Darhour, H. & Dahlerup, D. (Eds). Double-Edged politics on women's rights in the MENA region. Gender and Politics Series: Palgrave Macmillan. ISBN 978-3-030-27734-5.
- Davies, J. (2019). From severe to routine labour exploitation: The case of migrant workers in the UK food industry. *Criminology & Criminal Justice*, 19(3), 294-310.
- De la Porta, D. (2018). Solidarity mobilizations in the "Refugee Crisis". Contentious Moves. Palgrave.
- Decósse, F. (2017). Persistent unfree labour in French intensive agriculture: An historical overview of the 'ofii' temporary farmworkers programme. In A. Corrado, C. de Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area* (pp. 183-197). Routledge.
- Dekeyser, K. & Woolfrey, S. (2021). A greener Europe at the expense of Africa: Why the EU must address the external implications of the Farm to Fork Strategy.
- Doeringer, Peter B.; Piore, Michael J. (1971). Internal Labor Markets and Manpower Analysis. Harvard University: Washington, D.C.
- Doomernik, J., Garcés-Mascareñas, B., Güell, B. (2023). Seasonal Workers in Agriculture: The Cases of Spain and The Netherlands in Times of Covid-19. In Finotelli, C., Ponzo, I. (eds) Migration Control Logics and Strategies in Europe. IMISCOE Research Series. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-26002-5_11.





- Dyer, S., McDowell, L. & Batnitzky, A. (2010). The Impact of migration on the gendering of service work: The case of a west London hotel. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 17(6), 635-657.
- Eggert, N., & Giugni, M. (2015). Migration and social movements. In D. Della Porta and M. Diani (Eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Social Movements* (pp. 159-172). Oxford University Press.
- Eriksson, M. & Tollefsen, A. (2013). Of berries and seasonal work. In M. Geiger & A. Pécoud (Eds.), Disciplining the transnational mobility of people. International Political Economy Series. Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137263070_10
- EU. (2020). 'Farm to Fork Strategy for a fair, healthy and environmentally-friendly food system' <u>https://food.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2020-05/f2f_action-</u> plan_2020_strategy-info_en.pdf
- FECONS. (2017). Estudio sobre los Asentamientos Chabolistas [Study on Shanty Settlements]. Huelva.
- Fernández-Kelly, P. (1983). For we are sold, I and my people: Women and industry in Mexico's frontier. SUNY Press.
- Fernandez, D. C. & Sotelo, A. (2013). Outsourcing and the new labor precariousness in Latin America. *Latin American Perspectives*, 40(5), 14-26.
- Fialkowska, K. & Piechowska, M. (2016). New way, old pattern. Seasonal migration from Poland to Germany. *Arbor*, 192(777).
- Fleming, P. & Spicer, A. (2014). Power in management and organization science. The Academy of Management Annals, 8, 237-298.
- Forde C., MacKenzie, R. (2009). Employers' use of low-skilled migrant workers: Assessing the implications for human resource management. *International Journal of Manpower*, 30(5), 437-452.
- Gadea, R. et al. (2017). Effects of exposure to quaternary-ammonium-based biocides on antimicrobial susceptibility and tolerance to physical stresses in bacteria from organic foods. *Food Microbiology*, 63, 58-71. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2016.10.037</u>
- Gemi, E. (2017). Albanian migration in Greece: Understanding irregularity in a time of crisis. *European Journal of Migration and Law*, 19(1), 12-33.
- Gertel, J. & Sippel, S.R. (Eds.). (2014). Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh. Routledge.
- Giddens, A. (1982). Profiles and critiques in social theory. Macmillan.
- Gilbert, M. R. (1998). "Race", space, and power: The survival strategies of working poor women. Annals of the. Association of American Geographer., 88, 595-621. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2564094





Gorny, A. & Kaczmarczyk, P. (2018). A known but uncertain path: The role of foreign labour in Polish agriculture. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 64, 177-188. DOI: 10.1016/j.jrurstud.2017.12.015

Grimshaw, D. & Rubery, J. (2015). The motherhood pay gap: A review of the issues, theory and international evidence. *ILO*. <u>https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/working-papers/WCMS_348041/lang--</u> <u>en/index.htm</u>

- Güell, B. (2022). Intersectionality meets seasonal agricultural work: The case of Huelva in times of COVID-19. *Estudios Geográficos*, 83(293), e113. https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022119.119
- Hamedanian, F. (2022). Access to the European labor market for immigrant women in the wake of the COVID pandemic. *World*, *3*(4), 957-978. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/world3040054</u>
- Hartmann, H. (1976). Capitalism, patriarchy, and job segregation by sex. Signs, 1, 137-169. http://www.jstor.org/ stable/3173001
- Hellio, E. & Moreno, J. (2021). La ecología-mundo bajo plástico: Un análisis de la articulación entre la explotación de la naturaleza, el racismo y el sexismo en la producción de frutos rojos de Huelva [The ecology-world under plastic: An analysis of the articulation between the exploitation of nature, racism and sexism in the production of red fruits in Huelva]. Relaciones Internacionales (47), 125-142.
- Hoggart, K. & Mendoza, C. (1999). African immigrant workers in Spanish agriculture. Sociologia Ruralis, 39(4), 538-562.
- Holck L. & Muhr, S. L. (2017) Unequal solidarity? Towards a norm-critical approach to welfare logics. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 33(1), 1-11.
- Holvino, E. (2010). Intersections: The simultaneity of race, gender and class in organization studies. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 17(3), 248-277.
- Isin, E. (2008). Theorizing acts of citizenship. In E. Isin & G. Nielsen (Eds.), Acts of citizenship (pp. 15-43). Palgrave Macmillan.
- James, S. C. (1985). Weapons of the weak: Everyday forms of peasant resistance. Yale University Press.
- Janssens M. & Zanoni, P. (2014). Alternative diversity management: Organizational practices fostering ethnic equality at work. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 30(3), 317-331.
- Kabeer, N., Razavi, S., & van der Meulen Rodgers, Y. (2021). Feminist Economic Perspectives on the COVID-19 Pandemic. Feminist Economics, 27(1-2), 1-29. https://doi.org/10.1080/13545701.2021.1876906.





- Kilkey, M. & Urzi, D. (2017). Social reproduction in Sicily's agricultural sector: Migration status and context of reception. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(15), 2573-2590.
- Kukreja, R. (2021). Recouping masculinity: Understanding the links between macho masculinity and self-exploitation among undocumented South Asian male migrants in Greece. *Geoforum*, 122, 164-173.
- Landry, V. et al. (2021). The systemized exploitation of temporary migrant agricultural workers in Canada: Exacerbation of health vulnerabilities during the COVID-19 pandemic and recommendations for the future. *Journal of Migration and Health*,
- Li, T. (2017). The price of un/freedom: Indonesia's colonial and contemporary plantation labor regimes. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 59(2), 245-276.
- Lindner, K. & Kathmann, T. (2014). Mobility partnerships and circular migration. In J. Gertel & S. R. Sippel (Eds.), Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh (pp. 121-129). Routledge.
- Locke, R. (2013). The promise and limits of private power: Promoting labor standards in a global economy. Cambridge University Press.
- López-Sala, A. (2021). Luchando por sus derechos en tiempos de COVID-19. Resistencias y reclamaciones de regularización de los migrantes sinpapeles en España. *Revista Interdisciplinar da Mobilidade Humana*, 29(61), 83-96. https://doi. org/10.1590/1980-85852503880006106
- López-Sala, A. (2022). Voices from the fields. Migrant agriculture workers during Covid-19 in Spain and new forms of activism for dignity. *Estudios Geográficos*, *83*(293), e107. <u>https://doi.org/10.3989/estgeogr.2022113.113</u>
- López-Sala, A. & Molinero-Gerbeau, Y. (2022). Intersections of precariousness, vulnerability and quality of life of migrants with irregular status. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/361208583
- Mackintosh, M. (1981). Gender and economics. In K. Young, C. Wolkowitz & R. McCullagh (Eds.), *Of marriage and the market* (pp. 1-15). CSE Books.
- Matthews, G. & Ruhs, M. (2007). Are you being served? Employer demand for migrant labour in the UK's hospitality. University of Oxford. Centre on Migration, Policy and Society Working Paper No. 51, <u>https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/wpcontent/uploads/WP-2007-051-Ruhs</u>
- McDowell L., Batnitzky, A. & Dyer, S. (2009). Division, segmentation, and interpellation: The embodied labors of migrant workers in a Greater London Hotel. *Economic Geography*, 83(1), 1-25.
- McNevin, A. (2011). Contesting citizenship: Irregular migrants and new frontiers of the political. Columbia University Press.





Medland, L. (2021). 'There is no time': Agri-food internal migrant workers in Morocco's tomato industry. *Journal of Rural Studies, 88*, 482-490.

Melossi, E. (2021). 'Ghetto tomatoes' and 'taxi drivers': The exploitation and control of sub-Saharan African migrant tomato pickers in Puglia, southern Italy. *Journal of Rural Studies, 88*, 491-499.

- Mešić, N. Wikström, E. (2021). Ruptures and acts of citizenship in the Swedish berrypicking industry. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 88, 154-156.
- Mésini, B. (2014). The transnational recruitment of temporary Latino workers in European agriculture. In J. Gertel & S. R. Sippel (Eds.), Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh (pp. 71-82). Routledge.
- Mezzadra, S. (2004). The Right to escape. Ephemera. Theory and Politics in organization, 4(3), 267-275.

Mies, M. (2014). Patriarchy and accumulation on a world scale. Zed Books.

- Miles, R. (1989). Racism. London: Routledge.
- Mollett, S. & Faria, C. (2018). The spatialities of intersectional thinking: Fashioning feminist geographic futures. *Gender, Place & Culture*.
- Mora, M., Rodriguez, R., Zermeño, A. & Almeida, P. (2018). Immigrant rights and social movements. Sociology Compass, 12(8), e2599.
- Myrdal, G. (1962). An American Dilemma, Race and Class 4: 3-11.
- Nicholls, W. & Uitermark, J. (2017). Cities and social movements: Immigrant rights activism in the United States, France, and the Netherlands, 1970- 2015. John Wiley & sons.
- Nyers, P. & Rygiel, K (2012). Citizenship, migrant activism and the politics of movement. Routledge.
- Orjuela-Grimm, M. et al. (2022). Migrants on the move and food (in)security: A call for research. Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health, 24(5), 1318-1327.
- Ortlieb R. & Sieben B. (2010). Migrant employees in Germany: Personnel structures and practices. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal*, 29(4), 364-379.
- Padilla, G. F., Alcón, S. M., Galán, O. A., de la Rosa D, J., Beltrán, G. P. & Pichardo, R. J. (2021). Condiciones de vida y salud de la población inmigrante en los asentamientos de Huelva [Living conditions and health of the immigrant population in the settlements of Huelva]. Revista Española de Salud Pública, 95, 1-17.
- Palumbo, L. (2015). Protection of trafficked people in Italy: Policies, limits and challenges. Journal of Money Laundering Control, 18(1), 52-65. 10.1108/JMLC-01-2014-0001





- Palumbo, L. & Sciurba, A. (2018). The vulnerability to exploitation of women migrant workers in agriculture in the EU: The need for a Human Rights and Gender based approach. European Union.
- Papadopoulos, A. G., Fratsea, L. & Mavrommatis, G. (2018). Governing migrant labour in an intensive agricultural area in Greece: Precarity, political mobilization and migrant agency in the fields of Manolada. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 64, 200-209. 10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.03.013
- Park, J. & Kim, Y. (2020). Workers with different employment status have different exposures to work stressors and different responses to identical work stressors. *Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, 62(12), e710-e715.
- Pattenden, J. (2016). Working at the margins of global production networks: Local labour control regimes and rural-based labourers in south India. *Third World Quarterly*, *37*(10), 1809-1833.
- Perrotta, D. (2017). Processing tomatoes in the era of the retailing revolution. Mechanization and migrant labour in Northern and Southern Italy. In A. Corrado, C. De Castro & D. Perrotta (Eds.), *Migration and agriculture: Mobility and change in the Mediterranean area* (pp. 58-75). Routledge.
- Piore, M. (1979). Birds of passage: Migrant labour in industrialised societies. Cambridge University Press.
- Potter, M. & Hamilton, J. (2014). Picking on vulnerable migrants: Precarity and the mushroom industry in Northern Ireland. Work, Employment & Society. 10.1177/0950017013510760
- Refslund B. & Thörnquist, A. (2016). Intra-European labour migration and low-wage competition-comparing the Danish and Swedish experiences across three sectors. *Industrial Relations Journal*, 47(1), 62-78.
- Ressia, S., Glenda S. & Janis B. (2017). Operationalizing intersectionality: An approach to uncovering the complexity of the migrant job search in Australia. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 24(4), 376-397.
- Resta, G. (2020). The comparative Law of Dignity: An introduction. 66:1 MCGILL Law Journal — Revue de Droit de MCGILL. <u>https://lawjournal.mcgill.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/04/Article-15-Resta-EMBEDDED.pdf</u>
- Rodó-Zárate, M. (2021). Interseccionalidad. Desigualdades, lugares y emociones. [Intersectionality. Inequalities, places and emotions]. Editorial Bellaterra, 231 pp.
- Rodriguez, J. K., Holvino, E., Fletcher, J. K., & Nkomo, S. M. (2016). The theory and praxis of intersectionality in work and organizations: Where do we go from here? *Gender, Work and Organization*.
- Rogaly, B. (2008). Intensification of workplace regimes in British horticulture: The role of migrant workers. *Population, Space and Place, 14*(6), 497-510.





- Rogaly, B. (2009). Spaces of work and everyday life: Labour geographies and the agency of unorganised temporary migrant workers. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8198.2009.00290.x</u>
- Rogaly, B. & Qureshi, K. (2016). That's where my perception of it all was shattered': Oral histories and moral geographies of food sector workers in an English city region. Geoforum. 10.1016/j.geoforum.2016.03.003
- Rubery J., Grimshaw, D. & Johnson, M. (2018). Challenges and contradictions in the "normalising" of precarious work. *Work, Employment and Society*, 32(3), 509-527.
- Rye, J. F. & Scott, S. (2018). International labour migration and food production in rural Europe: A review of the evidence. *Sociologia Ruralis*, *58*(4), 928-952. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/soru.12208</u>
- Rye, J. F., Slettebak, M. H. & Bjorkhaug, H. (2018). From family to domestic and global labour? A decade of proletarisation of labour in the Norwegian horticulture industry. *European Countryside*, 10(4), 528-542.
- Schmid-Scott, A., Marshall, E., Gill, N. & Bagelman, J. (2020). Rural geographies of refugee activism: The expanding spaces of sanctuary in the UK. *Revue européenne* des migrations internationales, 36(2-3), 137-160.
- Scott, S. (2015). Making the case for temporary migrant worker programmes: Evidence from the UK's rural guest worker ('SAWS') scheme. *Journal of Rural Studies, 40*, 1-11.
- Siegmann, K. A., Quaedvlieg, J., & Williams, T. (2022). Migrant labour in Dutch agriculture: Regulated precarity. European Journal of Migration and Law, 24(2), 217-240. https://doi.org/10.1163/15718166-12340127
- Sippel, S. R. & Gertel, J. (2014). Shared insecurities? Farmers and workers in Bouchesdu-Rhône. In J. Gertel & S. R. Sippel (Eds.), Seasonal workers in Mediterranean agriculture: The social costs of eating fresh (pp. 37-48). Routledge.
- Solati, F. (2018). Women, work, and patriarchy in the Middle East and North Africa. Springer.
- Standing, G. (2011). The precariat: The new dangerous class. Bloomsbury Academic.
- Steinhilper, E. (2018). Mobilizing in transnational contentious spaces: Linking relations, emotions and space in migrant activism. *Social Movement Studies*, *17*(5), 574-591.
- Steinhilper, E. (2021). Migrant Protest. Interactive dynamics in precarious mobilizations. Amsterdam University Press.
- Tapia, M. & Alberti, G. (2019). Unpacking the category of migrant workers in Trade Union Research: A multi-level approach to migrant intersectionalities. Work Employment and Society, 33(2), 314-325.
- Taylor, M. & Rioux, S. (2018). Global Labour Studies. Polity.





Triandafyllidou, A. (2016). Irregular migrant domestic workers in Europe: Who cares. Routledge.

- Tyler, I. & Marciniak, K. (Ed.). (2014). Protesting citizenship: Migrant activisms. Routledge.
- Valkonen, J. & Rantanen, P. (2007). The question of seasonal migration and the practice of wild berry picking in Lapland. teoksessa *Ny migration och etnicitet i Norden* (2007 toim., Sivut 121-138). Åbo akademi.
- Van Den Borre L. & Deboosere, P. (2018). Health risks in the cleaning industry: A Belgian census-linked mortality study (1991-2011), *International Archives of Occupational and Environmental Health*, 91, 13-21.
- Verloo, M. (2006). Multiple inequalities, intersectionality and the European Union. European Journal of Women's Studies, 13(3), 211-228.
- Waldinger, R. & Lichter, M. I. (2003). How the other half work: Immigration and the social organisation of labour. University of California Press.
- Wright, E. O. (2000). Working-class power, capitalist-class interests, and class compromise. *American Journal of Sociology*, 105(4), 957-1002.
- Wright. J. B. (1985). The geological setting in geology and mineral resources of West Africa. Springer.
- Young, K., Wolkowitz, C. & McCullagh, R. (Eds.). (1981). Of marriage and the market. CSE Books.

DignityFIRM Lab 2.1

Intersectionality Guidelines

Applying an intersectional approach to understanding F2F irregular migrant workers

About DignityFIRM

Towards becoming sustainable and resilient societies we must address the structural contradictions between our societies' exclusion of migrant workers and their substantive role in producing our food.

www.dignityfirm.eu

